

# A Qualitative Study On The Realistic Impact Of The Corona Pandemic (COVID-19) On The Images Of Citizenship In A Global Environment: Jordan As A Case Study

Prof. Samih Mahmoud Al Karasneh<sup>1</sup>, Prof. Hadi Mohammad Tawalbeh<sup>2</sup>, Prof. Ali Ahmad Al Barakat<sup>3</sup>, Prof. Bushra Ahmad Alakashee<sup>4</sup>, Prof. Abdalla Falah El-Mneizel<sup>5</sup>, Dr. Mahmoud Awad Bani Theiyab<sup>6</sup>

<sup>1</sup>University of Sharjah, UAE, Dept. of Education, [skarasneh@sharjah.ac.ae](mailto:skarasneh@sharjah.ac.ae)

<sup>2</sup>Yarmouk University, Jordan Dept. of Curriculum and Instruction, [hadi.tawalbeh@yu.edu.jo](mailto:hadi.tawalbeh@yu.edu.jo)

<sup>3</sup>University of Sharjah, UAE, Dept. of Education, [aalbarakat@sharjah.ac.ae](mailto:aalbarakat@sharjah.ac.ae)

<sup>4</sup>University of Sharjah, UAE, Dept. of Education, [balakashee@sharjah.ac.ae](mailto:balakashee@sharjah.ac.ae)

<sup>5</sup>University of Sharjah, UAE, Dept. of Education, [amneizel@sharjah.ac.ae](mailto:amneizel@sharjah.ac.ae)

<sup>6</sup>[University of Sharjah](http://University of Sharjah), UAE, [mbanitheiyab@sharjah.ac.ae](mailto:mbanitheiyab@sharjah.ac.ae)

## Abstract

The current study emerged from the unfamiliar and unprecedented reality that the world has experienced at the beginning of 2020 due to the COVID-19 crisis. In this situation, the reality of citizenship with all its forms was globally challenged in all societies, since citizenship is usually in charge of adjusting and adapting societies in crises, that guarantees its survival in security, peace and stability. Thus, the current study aimed at providing real and actual images of citizenship as well as the national behavior from an environment (a country) that has limited financial and human potentials in comparison with developed countries. This qualitative study investigated the reality of citizenship images that were demonstrated through the practices of individuals and government as two parties, who have different roles albeit the same goal during the Corona crisis in Jordan. To achieve the target objective, a qualitative approach was followed, where data collection has been conducted through using semi-structured interviews, after confirming the validity and reliability of this instrument. The participants in the current study were fifty-three (53) interviewees who were from different fields; experts in education, in social science, teachers and college students. Data analysis has been performed using the grounded theory. The study revealed that during the Corona crisis, there were a number of main and sub-categories or features that displayed positive and negative practices that were demonstrated by both government and people. These features represented different forms and images of citizenship. After discussing such results, some recommendations were suggested accordingly.

**Keywords:** A Qualitative Study, Corona Pandemic (COVID-19), Citizenship

## Introduction

In an era that has many vital and dramatic changes in all aspects of life, the global competition has imposed a new condition that urges creative tools to cope effectively and productively with a virtual world that can be

difficult to adapt to. One of the greatest challenges that may occur within this new reality is the shift in human roles, forms and methods of communication and assembly, including community institutions. Upon close analysis of educational systems worldwide, it can be concluded that the utmost goal of such systems,

and their provided and constructive teaching and learning programs, is developing good citizenship with all its components, to trust a comprehensive growth of individuals, in terms of the cognitive, moto-psycho and affective domains, which enable them to assume their prospected roles and responsibilities in this new situation. In an attempt to bridge the gap between reality and the virtual world, educators may find it difficult to determine to what extent educational systems have achieved their goals or have created an environment that participates in the comprehensive development of individuals, to adapt and cope with this new world, or even to be able to survive.

In the virtual world, not only individual citizenship is under testing but also the effectiveness of educational systems in preparing citizens for crises, particularly in this open digital era. According to Al- Maroul (2014), it was confirmed that the national personality and the values of citizenship can be revealed clearly in crises, pandemics and critical situations. This is when a country needs the belonging of its citizens, their sacrifice and redemption. In such situations, moreover, the individuals demonstrate their ties with their homeland through national and humanistic acts that they are supposed to display by all means of giving; spiritually and financially.

Citizenship has diverse and multiple definitions due to the controversy in philosophies, perspectives and fields, which this concept springs from. Citizenship as a term, for instance, is defined as “a belonging to a nation or homeland” (The International Arab Encyclopedia, 311: 1996). It is also described in the British Encyclopedia as “A relationship between an individual and a state determined by laws of this state, and this relation guarantees the rights and duties in this country”. Based on the Center for National Education, citizenship was described as, “a membership in a political group in a society that demands an active participation that comes out of awareness, understanding and acknowledging the rights and responsibilities” (Center for Civic Education:94). Thus, upon an analysis of these definitions in literature, it can be extracted that the ideal meanings of citizenship

can be demonstrated in practices and actions more than in speeches and slogans. In Mahdi (2018), for instance, it was declared that citizenship goes in line with social acts, which demands moving beyond the symbolic theory towards having social practices that are based on integration and participation in all life aspects.

As a result, citizenship can be described as having all civil, political, social, cultural and economic rights, in turn, assuming all duties and responsibilities towards the country, which indicates a mutual commitment between the contemporary state and its citizens. In fact, this definition of citizenship represents the main concept that has been adopted in this study, since the researchers believe that these diverse meanings of citizenship imply sharing duties and responsibilities, assuming roles and demonstrating the finest forms of belonging through preserving all surrounding environments, which means conducting all what is required during the pandemics and crises through confronting consequences and impacts of such dangers. Hence, it can be concluded that the actual images, practices and values of citizenship can be revealed only in critical situations and crises that a country or even the world go through. In the current study, the Corona pandemic crisis (Covid-19) will be discussed as a real example of crises that the world has been experiencing since 2020.

In Lobo, Silva, and Zúquete (2018), it was confirmed that citizenship is tested during crises, since these can cause large-scale social, economic and environmental disturbances. In such critical situations, citizens and individuals also demonstrate their ability to coexist and adjust, since crises examine citizenship and shake social ties as described in Nolas (2015). In addition to that, crises can make dramatic historical changes that prove the patriotism and the cohesion of citizens. They are also considered an authentic experiment of the social ties among the classes in a society (Vaughn 2012), such as the ties between the strong and weak, the rich and poor, the privileged and deprived, the educated and illiterate, young and old ... etc (Furedi,2007). In other words, in critical situations, the integration in the national positions

of people can be drawn, either by finding a safe rescue or by damaging the citizenship stereotype. That is because all forms of appropriate and inappropriate acts embody the practices of citizenship at the highest level of clarity and transparency.

Moreover, according to Furedi (2007), crises can create feelings of weakness, insecurity as well as distrust among citizens. They also can cause a sense of tension and instability, which leads to a chaotic situation, where citizens refuse to assume their responsibilities. As a matter of fact, suggesting exemplary images of citizenship is demanded to cope with the devastating impacts of crises; political, economic, social, or health, as it is these days during the Covid-19 pandemic. During this crisis, in some developed countries properties were not safe due to some attacks and irresponsible acts of citizens. That is because these communities have lost their security, stability and reassurance. Besides, individuals were not able to devote themselves to assist others during this pandemic, since all aspects of life have been paralyzed, which means peace only can enhance productivity and creativity.

The Covid-19 pandemic is a global infectious disease that has threatened modern humans. Nowadays, human beings have been put under unfamiliar and unexpected conditions that have changed their behaviors towards themselves, others and their countries. It has also affected the feeling of solidarity as an aspect of citizenship, which resembles the backbone of modern societies and democratic systems. In fact, in this pandemic the main values of citizenship, such as the standards of self-regulation and social discipline of individuals, have been challenged. Citizens and citizenship acts during Covid-19 have been distinguished based on the degree of being self-regulated and disciplined in societies, and based on the commitment in assuming responsibilities and duties. These values, in fact, represent the ethical, social and spiritual heritage that are required to be demonstrated by citizens in crises, especially the Jordanian citizen, in whom such values have solid foundations in their culture and religion.

It is worth mentioning that the impacts of crises do not only affect the moment, but they

rather extend to the future as stated in Baez Ullberg (2017), who insisted that the real impacts of crises do not only affect the episodic events, but they also appear through long historical changes and processes, which will absolutely influence the future of communities. In other words, the acts (mechanism) of dealing with crises tend to spring from the individual's understanding and perception of citizenship and its forms and values, which they have been raised on. Thus, to achieve the objectives of the current study, it is necessary to clarify the different forms and values of citizenship that should be demonstrated by Jordanians, Arabs as well as other peoples worldwide.

Despite the fact that citizenship has multiple forms and values, it is obvious that the finest image of citizenship can be drawn through assuming responsibilities and cooperative efforts, which is called crisis management at the community level. Responsibilities indicate all procedures, actions, activities and reactions that are undertaken in the different sectors of society ; public, civil and private. That is, in order to maintain the security of the community, which is one of the main paradigms of citizenship (Abu Sharia, 2014). Thus, *Qalada* (2001), has stated that the finest image of citizenship can be displayed through the individual commitment to their duties and responsibilities with their adherence to customs, traditions and cultural values.

In addition to that, citizenship can also be demonstrated through an active participation in serving communities and maintaining security and stability. This, hence, can be achieved through the values of understanding, coexistence, and belonging, which are the essence of citizenship. Moreover, the importance of societal security as a main value of citizenship has been clarified in Burgess (2012: 8) who has defined community security as “... being protected from crises caused by deliberate and undeliberate human acts, natural disasters, or any technical failure, which demand cultural and ethical interaction between community members.” Therefore, societal security is one of the foundations of citizenship in which citizens of the community act the way they are supposed to in

order to confront the crisis and face its consequences. In Linnell (2014), furthermore, it was stated that a society is not only supposed to receive protection (passive), but it is demanded to protect (active), which demands a real image of citizenship to be embodied by individuals.

In the current study, therefore, it is believed that the Jordanian society, with all its components, should demonstrate a high level of cooperation and integration to create an active societal security. Jordanians should also assume all their responsibilities and duties effectively to confront the Covid-19 pandemic. That is why citizenship moves beyond regional and tribal social relations and ties, where it urges citizens to get outside their biological surroundings, and be willingly involved in a wider social circle as stated in Sinan (2017). The individuals, as a result, can become more conscious of their rights and duties as well as of their identity and roles that spring from citizenship, which forms the legal and emotional exchange between citizens and their country, so more engagement in voluntary work will be spotted in the society accordingly. Besides, it was clarified by Twigg (2009) that although community members may share the same place, interests, as well as common beliefs and circumstances, they cannot unite and cooperate until they have the same goals to achieve. In other words, citizens usually unite to face crises together, as is happening in Covid-19 pandemic, afterward they may go back to being separated, as it was before the danger, which is known in sociology as resilience according to Linnell (2014: 69).

Resilience, on the other hand, was also defined by Aguirre (2006: 1) as “the physical, biological, personal and cultural capacity of social systems in responding effectively to crises and recovering from such dangers and extraordinary circumstances caused by internal and external conditions”. It was also described as “the ability of communities and individuals to utilize their resources and expertise in emergencies in an integrative way with the services that are provided by the official institution (Government of Scotland, 2013: 4). This indicates that citizens’ awareness of the importance of their individual and group efforts,

in enhancing the resilience of their society is one of the main forms of citizenship. As a result, they should cooperate to keep communities secure as well as protect their society and its properties when they are at risk. Thus, community resilience relies mainly on the readiness of individuals, communities, organizations, and official institutions, in assuming the responsibilities and duties in emergencies. Besides, it depends on proper responses and fast recovery from such dangers, so that societal security can be enhanced and preserved, which is considered the most elegant form of citizenship, according to the researchers in the current study.

Another form of citizenship, that is revealed in emergencies, pandemics, wars and revolutions, is the individuals’ coexistence and their voluntary support to their governments to settle people down. This mission demands citizens to participate in protecting all social, economic and public health sectors. As a result, more stability and reassurance can be created in a society, as in Jordan, since citizens cooperate to confront this infectious disease that threatens all societies worldwide, which can lead to suggesting certain mechanisms to cope with pandemics. Upon a close investigation, of the countries around the world, it can be concluded that peoples’ response, coexistence, and interaction with this pandemic varies from one country to another, since these infectious diseases have raised different behavioral patterns. In some countries, for instance, some cultural and civilized behavior deficiencies have floated onto the scene when individuals failed to cope with such crises.

On the other hand, because citizenship can be demonstrated in all human activities, conducting educational research, such as in the current study, is another form of citizenship that represents an academic role that should be undertaken by educational institutions with the widespread presence of Covid-19. In a sense, the implementations of social studies by specialized academic institutions have a vital role in enhancing the appropriate behaviors of learners, and can decrease the level of anxiety that they may experience when they understand the consequences of such risks as well as when they assume their roles to improve public health

conditions, and create strategies to manage these situations, such as social distancing culture.

Therefore, providing a platform to be an informational resource for all those who are interested in the consequences of this pandemic on education by the National Council for Social Studies (NCSS) on March 11, 2020, is considered an effective step that came out of one of the global scientific institutions. This platform aims at keeping social studies teachers, administrators, and professionals updated with the latest developments of this pandemic, determining mechanisms and preventive procedures, as well as providing educational resources for teaching and learning to sustain learning in different environments, such as in virtual learning environments (NCSS, 2020). Besides, this council, in a partnership with the World History Digital Education Foundation (HDEF), has also offered three free learning modules for social studies teachers related to how to deal with the contemporary pandemic (Covid-19).

In addition to that, these modules include a variety of topics, such as a historical comparison with the 1918-influenza pandemic, geographical analysis of the spread of this pandemic, an analysis of the population pyramid of a number of countries, in addition to providing the government responses worldwide to face the crisis. It is worth mentioning that these modules have been designed, for three days, to be taught through distance or face-to face learning. Furthermore, some student teaching materials have been supplied to be presented in the classroom or in virtual learning environments (HDEF,2020). In other words, real citizenship does not only demand official efforts, it rather needs to be demonstrated through various, integrative and comprehensive efforts, which means there is no one fixed frame to be followed.

The current study, accordingly, examined the behaviors that have been applied by the Jordanian government and people in coping with this pandemic. Although Jordan has been infected by this pandemic, as the rest of the world, the economic, geo-political, social, and cultural reality of this country forced some to predict that Covid-19 will have extremely serious impacts on this society, especially in terms of the forms of

citizenship. As a consequence, analyzing the Jordanian context during the Covid-19 pandemic in this study is justified. Particularly, when the procedures taken by the government, as a main party in citizenship, were summed up with imposing the lockdown on various sectors of the Jordanian society and all its institutions, which were considered odd and difficult, and inevitably affect individual behaviors as the other party in citizenship. Thus, the researchers investigated the forms of citizenship demonstrated by the parties of citizenship (government and individuals) in the Jordanian society during the Covid-19 pandemic, which can form an essential step towards providing real evidence and suggestions so as to enhance, improve or change some of these citizenship acts.

As for the previous study, although there are tremendous studies that have investigated the forms and values of citizenship in literature, it can be stated that the current study may be considered the most recent and rarest in this field and this initiative topic, because the global COVID pandemic has created unexpected circumstances around the world. I believe that this has brought about some quite interesting changes in these forms and values, which has led me to investigate it deeply and critically in the reality of our current practices.

### **Statement of Problem**

The motive that underpinned this study has been triggered by the unfamiliar acts that floated on the scene by citizens across the globe, which appeared in an accelerated and short period. These new behaviors, which have been spotted by the researchers and caused by the Covid-19 pandemic, resulted in a serious crisis that threatened all humanity. Consequently, the concepts and forms of citizenship have been challenged, since citizenship urges all parties (the government and the people) to undertake their roles and assume their duties, so as to maintain the continuity and existence of life in its best form of development and stability. Thus, some reciprocal roles among the citizenship parties, in light of these variables and changes, should appear in different forms and situations. In other words, due to this pandemic, a new situation has been created with changeable roles of the

political, social, cultural and economic entities either from governments or their peoples. Therefore, it is demanded to identify the effects of this crisis that have been left on the reality of the national roles.

In this context, the current study aimed at revealing the forms of citizenship that have been inducted from the behaviors of people and government. In fact, Jordan, as well as all other countries around the world, has been affected by this pandemic, yet it can be declared that this country managed to successfully cope with this infectious disease. Thus, it is aimed at investigating the following two questions:

1. **What are the forms of citizenship demonstrated by the Jordanian people (unofficial party) during the Covid-19 pandemic based on the participants' perspectives?**
2. **What are the forms of citizenship demonstrated by the Jordanian government during the Covid-19 pandemic based on the participants' perspectives?**

### **Definitions of Terms**

The forms of citizenship: Operationally, the forms of citizenship are defined as the official (governmental) and unofficial (people) practices and acts that the parties of citizenship perform in different situations, either in assuming duties or in obtaining rights.

### **Methods**

A non-probability sampling method, purposeful sampling, was used. The purpose of this sampling procedure was to choose "information-rich key informants" who were likely to be knowledgeable and informative about the phenomena being investigated (McMillan & Schumacher, 1997, p. 397). Therefore, our selection of participants was largely based on participants' willingness and interest to talk, discuss, and reflect on their own educational, social and political experiences. The study sample consisted of 53 participant

(included: Professors, teachers, college students, parents, government employees, members of local community).

### **Data collection**

To answer the above questions, it's needed to 'get inside the participants' heads. The semi-structured interview was used in the present study. It is one of the most popular methods in social research. It allowed me to enter another person's world to understand that person's awareness (Patton, 1987). The developed semi-structured interview was checked in terms of its validity and reliability.

### **Data analysis**

The participants offered informative data and information that assisted in creating a perception about the forms of citizenship represented in the Jordanian society. To analyze these collected data, the grounded theory method (Strauss & Corbin 1990, and Haig 1995) was adopted. In the present study, an inductive approach to analysis, identifying the most important categories perceived in the data by coding and grouping concepts, was used (Burton, 2000). The analysis in this study, as in many others, followed a system of coding and identifying categories, based upon patterns and ideas that emerged from the data, collected in the field by data resources (Miles & Huberman 1994, and Patton 1990). Based on the analysis of data collected from the interviewees, two main categories were inducted according to each question; the first was the positive forms of citizenship demonstrated by Jordanian people, and the second was the negative forms of citizenship during the period of Covid 19 Pandemic. Each of these categories implied other sub-categories, which will be detailed in the next section.

### **Results**

The results were presented regarding the study questions, as follows:

#### **Results Related to the first question:**

**What are the forms of citizenship demonstrated by the Jordanian people (unofficial party) during Covid-19 pandemic based on the participants' perspectives?**

Based on data analysis, the participants' perspectives concerning **the forms of citizenship were divided into two main categories:** the first was the positive forms of citizenship demonstrated by Jordanian people, and the second was the negative forms of citizenship. Each of these categories implied other sub-categories, which will be detailed below.

### **I. The first main category: Positive Practices of Citizenship by Citizens**

The first feature of citizenship was related to the positive forms of citizenship that were demonstrated by the Jordanian people during the outbreak of Covid-19. All participants (53) revealed some positive forms of citizenship that have been reflected by the acts of citizens during the pandemic. Their responses, moreover, were grouped into six sub-categories, which were listed in order as follows:

#### **I.1 Social Roles and Affective Practices**

Forty-eight (90.56%) of the interviewees pointed out that the most positive forms of citizenship demonstrated by Jordanians during Covid-19 were represented through their social and emotional acts as well as practices. These behaviors were shown through multiple forms, such as social solidarity, love, compassion, sympathy and considering others' feelings during this pandemic. Besides, a warm and family spirit was also dominant as described by the participants, who also confirmed that even some social habits have also changed. It was indicated by one of the interviewees that,

“ during the lockdown, different social initiatives have been set, “ Dinaric” or One Jordanian Dinar (JD) and Bread at Doors, for example, were launched by certain associations to deliver bread to homes, with only one JD, in association with bakeries. Besides, people did not hesitate to give a hand and secure others' needs, particularly poor families”.

Someone added,

“.. other associations provided loans to day-by-day labors, and some lessors did not ask houses and shops' tenants for money, plus, some gave municipalities and associations their personal vehicles to distribute bread, foodstuffs... etc, which can tell how citizens got more committed, responsible and loyal to their people...”

“In our neighborhood, for example, we shared bread and other foodstuffs... one citizen once had paid for an old lady's bread telling her no need to pay, mother, it was paid...”

This can be attributed to the characteristics of Jordanian society, where the clan authority is highly dominant. As a result of this authority and all its positive forms, the social and emotional ties among people are affected, in a way that reveals their goodness through motivating them to set up initiatives that demonstrate their compassion and love for others. Contemporary history, for example, bears witness on unforgettable stands of Jordanian people with their brothers from Arab refugees, and how they have shared with them all aspects of life.

#### **I.2 Law Abiding Practices**

This sub-category, that was confirmed by the participants, was law abiding by citizens, where "No one was above the law". Forty-four (83.1%) of the participants believed that respect of the law or abiding was a distinguished feature demonstrated in citizens' practices. “No one is above the law” this slogan was confirmed in reality through peoples' adherence to regulations and instructions issued by the Defense Law, which enabled the Jordanian government to go through this pandemic successfully. This category or feature was clearly inducted from the participants' responses, as it was stated:

“ I realized that law abiding or respect is the most essential aspect to survive, we ( Jordanians) were really amazing during this crisis, since each

individual was following what is prescribed by the government..”

It was also added that

“ ... through citizens’ discipline and cooperation we managed to confront this crisis. Honestly speaking, Jordanians always have this spirit of accountability and no one should be above law”

This can be realized by the distinguished awareness and knowledge that the Jordanian society has, a fact that can be seen in people’s practices and behaviors. In other words, during this pandemic, Jordanians have demonstrated a high level of commitment to the law, and they have revealed a real tendency to abide by the instructions without being monitored and controlled by the government. Besides, the citizens’ self-initiatives can be regarded as a genuine desire for the rule of law.

### **1.3 Healthy Practices**

The third positive form of citizenship that was demonstrated by the Jordanian people was confirmed by 41 (77.35%) of the interviewees, which was health awareness and practices. This has become crystal clear through the preventive and personal hygiene practices, in and outside houses, that the citizens were requested to perform. Such healthy practices had absolutely assisted in decreasing the spread of this virus. Different participants noted this as they said,

“ We were following exactly what was prescribed by the Minister of Health, we started washing hands regularly, using sterilizers with all purchases that we used to buy .. We also got rid of some habits, such as avoiding shaking hands and kisses so as to enhance the public safety ...”

It was also emphasized that, “

...Children have received much direct health care, mothers kept giving health instructions, asking if their kids washed and sterilized their hands, they even

started sterilizing the gas cylinders, I swear..”, “ .. some volunteers were delivering medicines to houses, this can explicitly tell much about the spirit of the responsibility that people had, especially when they were cleaning up streets and neighborhoods...”

This commitment can be also attributed to the Jordanians’ conviction to adhere to the health awareness directives that were being issued by the official authorities. They were so responsive to all regulations and procedures that call for avoiding irresponsible acts that could cause harm others, the thing that clearly reflects this awareness. In addition to that, Jordanians tend to pay much attention to their personal and household hygiene, a fact that can interpret their high responsibility towards themselves and others. As it was stated by a citizen

### **1.4 Educational practices**

This subcategory, inducted from the interviews, was the instructional and educational practices. Based on data, thirty-eight participants (71.69%) highlighted this category as an important form of citizenship that started to be obvious during this pandemic. Jordanian parents made great efforts to sustain their children's education during this pandemic. In most cases, parents assumed teachers’ roles by providing the technological tools and supervising their usage. Some parents had to learn how to cope with technology so as to support and keep pace with their children during the online classes or the E-learning portal. This was confirmed by some comments provided by the participants in the current study, particularly when it has been stated:

“... To be honest, at the beginning of this crisis, I felt hopeless with e-learning, we were really under a challenge. Yet, we had to learn and master certain skills, I am now proud of my technological skills, I was helping my children to manage their time and follow up their homework assignments...”.



Another added, “ ... I was really keen to follow up with my kids, I was in touch with neighbors and relatives, we were discussing and sharing issues related to e-learning, and how to cope with technology or how to send and receive homework and assignments, which were too much..”.

This can be justified in light of the Jordanians’ deep belief in the importance of education in sustaining their survival. Thus, the Covid-19 pandemic did not deprive them from pursuing their children’s education on their own. In the lockdown, for example, they worked hard to provide the technological tools that are necessary to keep pace with the online classes and the e-learning portal to educate their children at all educational stages.

### **I.5 Productivity and Economic Practices**

Self-productivity has started to be valued by Jordanians and was confirmed as a positive form of citizenship by thirty-one participants (58.49%). Jordanians became aware of how to reduce the expenses and economic burdens, by taking advantage of what is available. They have also started cultivating their lands, raising domestic animals, and preparing bread at home, which indicates how citizens have become self-reliant in securing food. These practices were stated by multiple interviewees who said,

“This pandemic revealed our shortcomings, can you imagine, villagers do not have a kilo of flour or lentils in our houses? .. This crisis taught us how to have an economic life, we were thinking of bread, eggs, milk and yogurt. I know families that started baking bread and making milk...”.

Moreover, it is added, “... some of our neighbors used to make hygienic masks and sterilizers, others started cultivating their lands with crops, such as tomatoes, mint, radishes and other

vegetables, honestly speaking, this pandemic taught us to economize .. My brothers and I decided to grow wheat ... and raise chickens and goats ... to be prepared for more difficult circumstances.”

This can be attributed to the challenges of this crisis that forced them to rethink and reflect back on their past image prior to the 21<sup>st</sup> Century, when they were consuming what they grew and were wearing what they made. This also made them realize the necessity of their integrative roles, where they can depend on the self-production in providing the basic life requirements through cultivating their lands, raising domestic animals and preparing their home-made bread.

### **I.6 Sense of Belonging**

Sense of belonging to family, neighborhood or homeland was described by twenty-eight (52.83%) of the interviewees as one of the most important forms of citizenship. The Covid-19 pandemic has shown how Jordanians have demonstrated real belonging as citizens, who share the same land and destiny.

One of the participants pointed out:

“ in our neighborhood, some neighbors used to send food instead of storing it...”.

Another added, “... one of my neighbors kept asking us daily if we need anything from the bakery or market, however we had never talked before this pandemic ...

we noticed how people’s attitudes have changed positively, we no longer had quarrels and violence. This situation, on the contrary, made us feel in need of each other, so we embrace and love ourselves as Jordanian citizens.

This can be interpreted in light of the stability of the national situation that distinguishes the members of Jordanian society; which is reflected

in their loyalty and belonging that were demonstrated through their acts and behaviors during the pandemic. Therefore, the clear image of their homeland in their minds reflects their awareness, which reveals the sincere love and belonging that they have towards their country. Previously, Jordanians proved a high level of awareness when they did not compromise their country's security and life, especially during the Arab Spring demonstrations that became dominant in most Arab countries, although these demonstrations have seriously impacted the Jordanian society. Nevertheless, the bright image of Jordan in the citizens' hearts floated on the situation eventually, the thing that sustained and brought the stability back to the country.

## **2. The second main category: Negative Practices of Citizenship by Citizens**

The second main category of citizenship inducted from the interviews was the negative forms of citizenship demonstrated by the Jordanian people during the breakout of the Covid-19 pandemic. Based on the participants' responses, fifty-three (100%) interviewees have indicated that there were some negative acts, revealed by Jordanian people during the Covid-19 pandemic, which contradict with the forms of citizenship. Through data analysis, these negative features were categorized into three sub-categories ordered based on the frequency of the responses, which were as follows:

### **2.1 Unhealthy Practices**

It was inducted from data that there were certain unhealthy practices dominant between citizens during this pandemic. These practices were confirmed by forty-six (86.79%) participants, and they were represented through the carelessness and recklessness of citizens. This feature was expressed through a number of comments, such as,

“.. some infected people or those who contacted infected citizens were so careless, they did not get medical examinations, as what happened with the infected person who was at the party (wedding), which doubled the number of infected

people. Or, the truck driver who caused a wide outbreak of the pandemic in Jordan”.

Not being familiar with assuming group responsibility by some individuals, such as caring about others and causing them no harm, can interpret this. Besides, this may be attributed to a lack of some values that are related to the health domain since this is regarded, by some, as a personal matter without recognizing its impacts on the whole community. This issue may demand a re-evaluation of the citizenship education especially in the curriculum.

### **2.2 The Conception of Civil Rights**

Thirty-nine (73.58%) of participants thought that one of the negative acts shown in this crisis was some citizens' failure in conceiving civil rights that are guaranteed by law. Thus, there were illegal acts, as described by some interviewees,

“ a minor group of people did not abide by the law, regulations and the Defense Law, either due to the lack of awareness or ignorance, they even thought that such acts are protected by their civil rights..”.

Besides, it is said that, “ ... some people, for example, violated the curfew, and rushed to buy and store goods, as they thought this right is granted by law in such a difficult situation...other citizens did not respect the public safety measures, such as social distancing, instead they were gathering in some places as in shopping centers, and when they were questioned, they justify their act as enjoying a granted right..” .

This can reveal a lack in the practices of civic education among some Jordanians, who are not acquainted with the main concepts of citizenship from the national and civic education. In addition, Jordan, as all countries, embraces individuals

who are not willing to abide by the law at the expense of their personal interests and desires. Thus, a gap between rights and duties is clearly spotted; there are many individuals who are fully aware of their rights but they ignore their duties.

### 2.3 Economic Practices

Having some negative economic acts was obvious, during this pandemic, which was another feature inducted and confirmed by thirty-five (66.03%) of the participants in the current study. These acts, which were demonstrated by both citizens or merchants, contradict with the spirit of citizenship, as was explained by one of the interviewees,

“ ..honestly speaking, some strange and greedy acts floated on the scene by some merchants, who took advantage of people, by monopolizing some commodities and by raising the goods prices, instead of helping in such conditions ... plus, some citizens have bought and stored foodstuffs in a large quantity, which negatively affected others in a lack-of- patriotism behaviors”.

Moreover, this may be interpreted as a failure in developing the main concepts of economic education. In other words, this can be justified by a lack in the content of national and civic syllabi in Jordan, since there were not included indicators that promote the proper behaviors of the economic citizenship, such as the awareness of the main concepts of production, consumption and the reasonable profit. Thus, it is no wonder that some negative economic practices have floated on the scene by those who work on fulfilling their personal desires without considering the group demands. (price gouging).

#### Results Related to the Second Question:

**“What are the forms of citizenship that have been demonstrated by the Jordanian government during the Covid-19 pandemic?”**

Based on data analysis, the participants' perspectives concerning the forms of citizenship were divided into two main categories: the first was the positive forms of citizenship demonstrated by Jordanian government, and the second was the negative forms of citizenship. Each of these categories implied other sub-categories, which will be detailed in the next section.

#### **The first main category: The positive practices demonstrated by the Jordanian government during the breakout of the Covid-19 pandemic.**

Some forms of citizenship demonstrated by the Jordanian government during the breakout of the Covid-19 pandemic were described as positive during this crisis by fifty-three (100%) participants. Based on their responses, the inducted data were categorized into five sub-features related to the forms of citizenship that were exhibited by the government. These categories are listed in a descending order based on the frequency of the responses, as follows:

##### **1.1 The Security Aspect**

As a positive form of citizenship, it was stated by forty-seven (88.67%) participants that the government practices of providing security and protecting people were wise and comprehensive, and these acts extended beyond protecting lives and bodies, they moved to encompass all aspects of life. As described in the following comments:

“Jordan has been affected with Covid-19 as all countries worldwide, as the health systems globally have been challenged by having many deaths and infected people, we started considering what our country has done with infected and suspected returnees, in comparison with what was being conducted in other great countries, such as the USA, Italy, and Spain”.

Besides, It was added that

“the government has taken several precautionary measures to

stop the outbreak of this pandemic, some travelers, who were coming from abroad, were quarantined in five-star- hotels in the Dead Sea area and Amman. Some regions and governorates were isolated, as what happened in the Irbid governate, and the spread of the Jordanian Army and security forces in the streets was accompanied with setting the Defense Law of 2020.. we had a feeling of safety when our army was spread in the streets ...."

This can be attributed to having a governmental vision and plans in Jordan regarding the management of the citizenship issues during crises. This is proved by the presence of the National Center for Crisis Management that assumed managing Covid-19 pandemic issues, which presented Jordan as a country that has long-term plans. Despite the security situation during the pandemic, Jordan can be considered an advanced country that foresaw the future with all its challenges, since it included all of these challenges in the security file. This came out of a governmental conviction that the security of the citizens is the elixir of the continuity of the Jordanian country that is surrounded by many crises and challenges.

### **1.2 Managing the Health Sector (system)**

One of the items, that made people think that the government led this crisis wisely, was its management of the health sector. This was described by forty-five (84.90%) of the interviewees, who were impressed with these health practices, and how these made them feel appreciated by their country. The Ministry of Health and its cadres are regarded by citizens as the first defense of the people in this pandemic, in addition to the epidemiological investigation teams who were working twenty-four hours, dealing with infected people, and operating hot-lines with civil defense in the case of any infected person as it was said,

"We are okay as long as our medical staff are well-prepared".

The situation is really different and the government has made tremendous efforts in managing the health domain, which resulted in a decrease in the number of work and traffic accidents (the tank deterioration in the-Zarqa governorate and running over a young girl by a driver who violated the lockdown in the Irbid governorate)

This came out of the Jordanian governments' realization that gaining the citizens' trust and true citizenship comes through preserving their health, which goes in line with the "Human Capital" slogan that has been raised in Jordan and demands a real investment in human beings. Besides, with the presence of the open resources of knowledge in the digital era and how the world has been turned into a small village, the government became aware of how the Jordanian citizen is able to watch the acts and measures of governments worldwide during the pandemic and to compare that with his/her own country. Thus, the Jordanian government is totally convinced that the degree of citizens' belonging would strengthen if the government's role has been sufficiently performed.

### **1.3 Managing Government Media**

It was confirmed by forty (75.47%) participants that the government media and announcements were a main source of positivity during the Covid-19 crisis. Citizens became trusting of only the data, news and announcements that were being issued officially by the government. In comparison with previous occasions, the interviewees believed that this practice was missing in the past, since government media used to be the last to state, and its announcement tended to be unreliable or nontransparent. Although, people previously tended to obtain information from multiple resources, during this pandemic a consensus among Jordanians has developed that the official sources of news are the most trusted channel. This was shown through people's daily waiting for the government announcement in the evening, which made rumors more limited, as some said;

“... Previously, the government announcements were the last, no wonder people were looking for the information from other sources...”.

“For the first time, I have started watching the official channel during the crisis. It became the official trustworthy source for announcements and news... even we (my family and I) wait for the daily announcement of the government every evening, which has decreased the spread of rumors and false news”

This may come out of a governmental conviction and belief in the influential power and authority of media with all its means, which have become available for all. This led people to have a share in all fields even if some are not accurate sometimes. Therefore, the government took actions to restore people’s trust and confidence in the official media, especially after the previous teacher’s syndicate crisis that revealed people’s distrust in the official media, which was mainly absent at that time.

#### **1.4 The Economic and Commercial Role**

Thirty-eight (38) of the interviewees (71.69%) confirmed that the government had taken certain economic and commercial procedures to fulfill the citizens’ needs of food and supplies. Besides, according to the participants, some measures were also taken by the Jordanian government to protect the citizens from some harmful economic practices and acts of some. For instance, the government had controls over the prices of goods and guaranteed the availability of certain goods in the market. Undoubtedly, this reflected a positive citizenship image at its best as was confirmed by the interviewees.

government assumes its duties and responsibility towards its citizens, as it was said,

‘ the prices were not raised by the government, most things were available and some penalties were imposed on some exploiters”.

“Absolutely the government has been keen to monitor the market and to spot any changes that may have occurred, besides many strict instructions have been provided by the government in this regard...”

This may be due to the Jordanian government’s belief in the importance of the economic and commercial field, with all its productive branches, in preserving Jordan with all its entities. What’s more, the government realized how the economy of the country is the main source of strength and prestige in any crisis. Thus, constant reassuring messages have been announced, all throughout this pandemic, related to the country's strategic stock that can last for months. As a consequence, the purchasing and warehousing acts of citizens and merchants were affected.

#### **1.5 The Educational Role**

Throughout this crisis, maintaining education by the government was another positive aspect described by thirty-three (62.26%) participants. In fact, the Ministry of Education has launched an educational portal called Darsak, the Arabic word for your lessons. It was designed for every student from first grade up to twelfth grade (Tawjihi) to sustain their learning during the lockdown. Besides, the Ministry of Higher Education directed universities to continue teaching through distance learning (e-learning), which can reveal the technological and scientific development that Jordan has started to have, as it is said,

“ we learned during this pandemic, we got educational content and technological skills..”

“ ..we all have learned during this pandemic, differently but we did learn many things in

terms of the instructional content or even computer skills..”

“ I believe that the government has proved a high level of commitment to the Jordanian’s students who deserve the best..”

This came out of a realization that humans are the capital of this country, which had distinguished Jordan among the regional countries due to the capacities of its citizens and their roles in the local and regional reconstruction. Thus, this positive reputation of Jordan led to more financial improvement and transfers that were caused by the academic and intellectual ability of its citizens. Accordingly, the Jordanian government has taken many steps to provide its citizens with more empowerment in terms of the cognitive and motor skills, which are vital for each stage in schools and universities.

### **The second main category: The negative practices demonstrated by the Jordanian government during the breakout of the Covid-19 pandemic.**

There was a consensus in the responses of the thirty-five participants (100%) that this pandemic had left negative impacts on the image of citizenship. Upon close analysis, the interviewees’ responses were categorized into six other sub- categories and were organized as follows:

#### **1.1 The Economic Role**

This category, which had the highest percentage, indicated that forty-three participants (81.13%) agreed that the government had performed some negative procedures and practices. For example, opening the public sectors during the lockdown, in the pandemic, on the condition of registering in social security by citizens was one of these measures. Besides, the participants focused on the 10% deduction of the salaries and on cancelling the promotions and bonuses as other negative practices by the government in a period that most Jordanians stopped working for a long time. As it was stated,

“ .. the government got back to its previous acts by relying on

the citizen’s pocket” fund”, worse came to worst when they guaranteed giving salaries for two years, but they asked citizens for donation...”

“.. the Governor of the Central Bank confirmed having financial savings of more than a billion resulting from the drop in the oil prices...”

“ .. the government got back to the citizen’s pocket, although it was stated that salaries are secured for two years, they imposed a compulsory donation on citizens... the governor of the Central Bank confirmed that there was a financial savings of more than a billion due to a decrease in the oil prices, so where are the governmental decisions about the profits of large companies and the owners of fiefdoms?”

This can be attributed to the conviction of the political and economic decision makers, who believe in the importance of expanding the citizens’ participation in social security as a step to protect the civil rights of citizens and workers. Besides, the previous awareness campaigns that were given to encourage people to register in social security were useless. That is why, the government is linked between opening the shops, establishments, institutions... etc with registering in social security, as a step that can benefit such sectors.

#### **2.2 The Health Role**

It was stated by forty participants (75.4%) that health procedures of the government were unsuccessful, which was shown in their responses in the interviews, as some explained:

“ ... I believe that the government has neglected serious health issues, such as allowing some Jordanians to get back from foreign countries that have a high record of infections without cautious measures and

procedures.. One infection has confused all of Jordan, so how come the government has done this..?”

“ ... One of the most wrong measures by some municipalities was distributing bread and dealing with citizens' needs for foodstuffs.. these practices were not planned well..”

This can be attributed to the reduced experience that Jordan has in dealing with such pandemics. Although there were many proper measures and procedures which had been taken, there were other improper procedures due to the lack of experience in coping with this situation.

### 2.3 The Security Role

The measures that were taken by the government to control the borders and the entry of drivers were another feature that caused negative attitudes during the Covid-19 pandemic, as described by thirty-six (67.92%) interviewees. Some of these measures were about to cause a disaster in Jordan, until the epidemiological investigation teams in the Irbid governate managed to identify and control such gaps that caused many infection cases. Such acts, therefore, referred to the duty and responsibility of the government more than citizens. One commented,

“ Irbid governorate endured a calamity for the homeland, if the case of the first infected truck driver had not been timely discovered, there would have been a real health disaster in Jordan”.

“ We assumed our duties and responsibilities, how about the government which is in charge of protecting the borders, did it assume its duties”?”

This may be due to having less Jordanian experience in dealing with such pandemics, which resulted in some health procedures and practices that were improper, although the

government has set up the National Center for Crisis Management. Moreover, it can also be attributed to the lack of prior preparation for this pandemic, when it broke out suddenly worldwide.

### 2.4 The Organizational Role

Regulating and granting the roaming permits by the government for urgent cases and some sectors through digital platforms, was one of the negative forms of citizenship that was confirmed by twenty-two interviewees (41.5%). According to the participants, the process of granting such permits was based on “favouritism” and unfair procedures. It was stated by some that:

“ .. I had a feeling that the permits were given only for some, there was ignorance for many cases with much delaying ...”

“ It seemed to me that granting permits was affected by the dominant clan culture in Jordan, some facilities were given to some whereas others were deprived...”

This can be attributed to the clan system that is dominant in the Jordanian society, which has strengthened the kinship ties and intimate social relations. However, this led to granting some facilities for some while they did not deserve it. At the same time, this system might deprive some individuals from having permits that they were really in need of. This issue can also be due to a certain pattern of life that people are already accustomed with, which keeps urging them to get what they want through such short and illegal ways that has become a societal feature.

### Discussion and Conclusions

Throughout the current study, it has been observed by the researchers how educating individuals on the forms of citizenship can be considered as an utmost goal of governments, which can be achieved through education and educational systems, and through curricula, textbooks, as well as other curricular and extracurricular activities. It is also believed that the continuity of all nations, especially those which are at risk of disasters and challenges,

depends mainly on citizenship values that their people have. Obviously, the ranks of countries worldwide keep moving between developed and developing in a dynamic manner. However, it is evident that the few countries that have certain stable ranks are those that are more capable of confronting and managing crises.

During the Covid-19 pandemic, the measures taken by many countries globally were challenged. Besides, some political systems failed to cope with this crisis that has threatened all aspects of life. Upon a close analysis of the global situation, the Covid-19 pandemic uncovered the inability of some countries in facing this infectious disease. Therefore, some might wonder how citizenship and confronting such a pandemic are interrelated. However, it can be stated that the success of any country in confronting difficulties relies basically on its citizens and to what extent they abide by the values and forms of citizenship, such as health awareness, adherence to regulations and instructions, assuming individual and group responsibilities and loving and caring about others.

Moreover, in the light of this investigation, it can be concluded that the measurement of citizenship can not only be tested by considering the general view and image, instead the details should also be measured. In Jordan, for example, it is insufficient to focus generally on the values of citizenship for 9 million people as a whole, but it should count each individual act. During this pandemic, it was revealed how an irresponsible individual act of an infected person could transmit the infection to many citizens and governorates, particularly when citizens do not adhere to the regulations and follow instructions, such as in keeping social distance. These acts have been witnessed in Jordan during the pandemic and transmitted the infection to many Jordanian citizens. On the other hand, regardless of these challenges, it is worth mentioning that the Jordanian government managed to lead and assume its roles and responsibilities firmly and steadily. The government has also given a role model in caring for the welfare of citizens from different nationalities, without compromising their rights.

Financial and spiritual support has also been provided by the government, where it kept urging people to be patient, resistant, fearless and strong.

Another conclusion that can be inducted during this crisis is the effective role of the Jordanian citizens. For example, bread and water were being supplied for free to those who could not get bread and water for their families by some owners of bakeries and water stations, in cooperation with the Armed Forces. In addition to that, Jordanian children after this crisis got more knowledge and awareness about this infectious virus, and they have also become more aware of the importance of personal cleanliness and sterilizing. Instead of being afraid of Security and Armed Forces, young Jordanians showed more gratitude and pride to them, they even kept scattering roses on them when they were passing by their houses during the curfew.

Although the majority of citizens revealed positive features of citizenship at its best, some people were careless and reckless towards the implementation of the governmental decisions and instructions, as they kept holding gatherings, such as in weddings and buying foodstuffs, which means they were prioritizing their interest over their countries.

In addition to that, there were images of negative practices demonstrated by the government in different fields as well. This has resulted in more problems that exhausted and frustrated citizens, and made them more anxious and dissatisfied about the economic, health and security sectors, since these practices were not explained or justified.

Accordingly, the researchers can conclude that the real citizenship images are tested during crises and pandemics, regardless of their reasons and environments. Based on the results of the current study, it was revealed that the Covid-19 pandemic has affected the images of citizenship, so it can be regarded as a realistic initiative to re-evaluate the programs of citizenship education in all environments, since the images of citizenship with all its forms are not only limited to poor or rich countries, but rather they can be found everywhere. In other words, these images and forms can be found in Jordan as well as many countries worldwide. In some developed



countries, however, some of these practices might be more positive or negative during the pandemic, such as Australia, Britain, Canada and in the United States.

Citizenship education ought to be concerned with establishing values and images of citizenship among citizens to cope with crises. Besides, it may focus on building citizenship that reduces the negative acts and practices during pandemics. This education may promote the positive practices and behaviors that support finding interactive, cooperative and participatory environments, which are physically and spiritually safe and secure. In other words, citizenship values usually regulate people's behaviors during crises, where cooperation and humanity can be dominant. Thus, the current study has distinguished it as it conveys this issue from a real situation. This is because of discussing an issue that is related to Jordan on one side, but simulates global environments at the same time, since human behaviors tend to be the same when related to life and death.

In the current study, it is recommended to review the programs, methods and procedures that are in charge of citizenship education through the support of building the culture of crises and the culture of responsibilities. Besides, it can be suggested, in this study, that the duties and rights should be considered within the citizenship framework that respects reciprocity and complementarity in addition to strengthening the bonds between the two parties of the Social Contract; the government and individuals. The current study also encourages conducting further studies that investigate the national behaviors in other contexts and environments.

## References

1. Abu Sharia, H., (2014). Citizenship and its Roles in Building Culture of Democracy. *Dirasat, Human and Social Sciences*, 41,546-562.
2. Aguirre, B. E. (2006). On the concept of resilience (Preliminary paper #356). Disaster Research Center, University of Delaware, Newark, DE, USA.
3. Al- Faqeer, F., (2001). Democratic Women without Democracy. *Al-Mustqbal Arabi Magazine*, 271. Beirut, Lebanon
4. Al- Kuwari, A. (2001). The Concept of Citizenship in a Democratic State. *Al-Mustqbal Arabi Magazine*, 264. Beirut, Lebanon
5. Al-Maroul, M., (2014). Crises: Definition, Causes, Effects and Roles in Deepening Patriotism, Riyadh: Law and Economics Library.
6. Baez ullberg, S. (2017) La contribución de la antropología al estudio de crisis y desastres en América Latina”. *Iberoamericana – Nordic Journal of Latin American and Caribbean Studies*, 46 (1): 1-5.
7. Burgess, J. P. (2012). Annex A—Conceptual considerations for the ETTIS project—J. Peter Burgess Contribution. In D.1.2. A working definition of societal security (pp. 22–26). Oslo, Norway: European Security Trends and Threats in Society (ETTIS). Retrieved on April 13, 2020, from [http://ettis-project.eu/wpcontent/uploads/2012/03/D1\\_2.pdf](http://ettis-project.eu/wpcontent/uploads/2012/03/D1_2.pdf).
8. Burton, D.(2000) *Research Training for Social Scientists : A Handbook for Postgraduate Researchers*. London: SAGE.
9. Center for Civic Education (1994). *National Standards for Civics and Government*. Calabasas, CA: Center for Civic Education.p.4.
10. Encyclopedia Britannica Inc.: *The New Encyclopedia, Britannica, (Knowledge in Depth)*, 15th (ed.), (University of Chicago, 1992) (3), p.332
11. Furedi, F. (2007) *The changing meaning of disaster*”. *Area*, 39 (4): 482-489.
12. Government of Scotland. (2013). *Building community resilience: Scottish guidance on community resilience*. Retrieved on April 13, 2020, from <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2013/04/2901>
13. Greer, S. L. (2013) *European Citizenship in Crisis: Citizenship Rights and Austerity Politics*. Retrieved on April 15 2020 at <http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2214868>.
14. Haig, B.D. (1995), *Grounded Theory as Scientific Method. Philosophy of Education* 28 (1):1-11

15. International Arab Encyclopedia (1996). Encyclopedia of works for publishing and distribution. Riyadh, Saudi Arabia, P. 311.
16. Linnell, M. (2014). Citizens response in crisis: Individual and collective efforts to enhance community resilience. *Human Technology*, 10 (2) 68-94.
17. Lobo, M.C., Silva, F.C. and Zúquete, J.P. (2018) Changing Societies: Legacies and Challenges. Vol. ii. Citizenship in Crisis; Eds.; Imprensa de Ciências Sociais: Lisboa, Portugal, pp. 135–160.
18. Mahdi, H. R. (2018). Awareness of digital citizenship among users of social networks and its relationship to some variables. *International Journal of Learning Management Systems*, 6(1) 11-24. Al-Aqsa University
19. McMillan, J.H. and Schumacher, S.S. (1997) *Research in Education: A Conceptual Introduction*. Longman, New York.
20. Miles, M.B. and Huberman, A.M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis*, 2nd Ed., p. 10-12. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.
21. Mohammad, M. K. (2011). Public Sector in Saeed Egypt: Poverty of Citizenship or Citizenship of Poverty. Arab Unity Center for Studies, 392. Egypt
22. Muhfouz, & et. al, (2008). Citizenship and National Unity in the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia: Thoughts and Criticism. Foundation of Arab Intishar, Beirut, Lebanon.
23. National Council for Social Studies (NCSS) (2020) NCSS Resources for Navigating Coronavirus Disease 2019 (COVID-19) Retrieved on April 17 from <https://www.socialstudies.org/ncss-covid19-resources#webinars>
24. Nolas, S. M. (2015). Children's participation, childhood publics and social change: a review. *Children and Society*, 29 (2): 157-167.
25. Patton, M.Q. (1990). *Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods*, 2nd Ed. Newbury Park: CA, Sage.
26. Qalada, W.S. (2001). *The Principle of Citizenship*. Dar Al-Shorouk: Cairo
27. Sinan, B., (2017). Features of Citizenship: Parish on the Islamic Political Heritage. Berline, Germany, Arab Democratic Center for Publication.
28. Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. M. (1990). *Basics of qualitative research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques*. Sage Publications, Inc.
29. The International Arab Encyclopedia of Citizenship. (1996). Encyclopedia of Business Publication and Distribution, Riyadh, Saudi Arabia, p:311.
30. The World History Digital Education Foundation (HDEF) (2020) COVID-19. Retrieved on April 17 from <https://www.worldhistoryde.org/COVID-19>.
31. Twigg, J. (2009). Characteristics of a disaster-resilient community: A guidance note. Version 2, November 2009. Paper from the Aon Benfield UCL Hazard Research Centre, University College London, London, UK. Retrieved on April 13, 2020, from <http://discovery.ucl.ac.uk/1346086/1/1346086.pdf>.
32. Vaughn, S. E. (2012) Reconstructing the citizen: disaster, citizenship, and expertise in racial Guyana". *Critique of Anthropology*, 32 (4): 359-387.