

Practices Of Heutagogical Approach Among Islamic Education Teachers in Secondary School

Noor Muslieah Mustafa Kamal¹ Zaharah Hussin^{2*} dan Abdul Muhsien Sulaiman³

^{1 2 3} Faculty of Education, Universiti Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, MALAYSIA

*Corresponding author: zaharah@um.edu.my

ABSTRACT

The globalisation of education has necessitated a number of modifications in teaching methods. Heutagogy is a teaching method that emphasises the importance of students studying autonomously. Approaches such as heutagogy can improve the teaching and learning by focusing on student-centred learning. Nevertheless, how are heutagogical methods used by Islamic Education teachers in secondary schools implemented? To answer this, research was conducted using qualitative methods using a case study design. Data were gathered through semi-structured interviews and document analysis. Purposive sampling was used to identify four secondary school Islamic Education teachers from four different schools in four states as study participants. Four criteria are defined, namely; (a) subject matter for Islamic Education, (b) possess a professional qualification in Islamic Education, (c) have a minimum of 5 years of teaching experience, (d) receive teaching-related honours and e) voluntarily interested in participating in the study. Interview data were transcribed and thematically examined before being triangulated with document analysis. In order to construct an accurate theme, data from all participants were compared. The study's findings show that Islamic Education teachers use heutagogical elements in their teaching. These findings may have an impact on educators in particular and school administrators in general in terms of improving teaching ways of meeting students' current needs. In addition, the application of collaborative to students has the potential to open up an effective learning environment for the involvement of stakeholders in improving national education.

Keywords: heutagogy; Islamic Education; teaching and learning

Introduction

Teachers require a wide range of interdisciplinary and holistic teaching abilities in order to fulfil the demands of globalization-era competitiveness (Muhammad Ayisy Baharudin & Mohd Ashraf Ibrahim, 2019). In the twenty-first century, education is a critical component in developing knowledgeable and diversified human capital (Hase, 2001). Students, on the other hand, have greater autonomy when they take the initiative and demonstrate interest in the learning process, in addition to understanding the topic and examining the educational resources. Learners have the flexibility to explore knowledge and to pursue their own interests in order to determine the pattern of learning that best suits their souls and ambitions, as well as their academic interests. According to the goals of national education, which supports self-learning as one of the

student-centred teaching methodologies by following their own strengths and capabilities, this is in accordance with the recommendations of national education (MOE, 2013). Students will be able to feel the learning experience while also being aware of the process of collecting knowledge and learning resources itself in this method (Blaschke et al., 2016; Fisk, 2017; KPM, 2013; Ibn Khaldun, 2002).

Background of study

There are a number of innovative methods to education evolving in response to the changing needs of students, including heutagogy. According to Hase & Kenyon (2000), the concept of heutagogy refers to a method for teaching people how to make their own decisions for themselves. In heutagogy, students are encouraged to use their own personal

experiences, knowledge, desires, and creativity to develop optimal learning patterns. As heutagogy introduces new teaching methods, it alters the way students are taught, allowing them to compete on a more level playing field in the workplace. A self-directed learning philosophy embodied by the national curriculum is in keeping with this heutagogic method (MOE, 2013). Heutagogy's main concepts are also in line with the goals of Islamic education, which emphasises the development of students' potential via ongoing education and guidance (Ibnu Khaldun, 2002).

Heutagogy emphasises the importance of fostering students' sense of self-worth, autonomy, and joy in learning. Students who are given the opportunity to choose the techniques and information they wish to learn are more likely to be self-confident (Moore, 2020). Students will have more time to learn and will take an active role in the process. When students are involved in the design of content and learning processes, flexible assessment of learning, active and collaborative learning, encouragement of exploration with a variety of learning resources, and a reduction in control during learning sessions, a heutagogical teaching and learning environment can be implemented (Hase and Kenyon, 2013).

Heutagogy, on the other hand, is built on six elements that allow students to engage in discussions about the learning process, engage in active learning activities, and achieve continuous and recurring learning results. Exploration, creation, collaboration, connection, sharing, and reflection are a few examples of these components (Blaschke, 2016). Students are taught to be self-reliant by instilling in them a sense of trust and confidence in their ability to study. Allowing students to take charge of their own education requires the teacher to be flexible in how much control they have over the process (Coomey & Stephenson, 2001). Students' actions and learning patterns will be monitored and controlled by the teacher in this mentoring role. Teaching and learning, according to the Ministry of Education (MOE), is facilitated by instructors in six ways: planning, control, mentors, motivators, and evaluators. A facilitator should

be well-versed in the subject matter he or she is tasked with facilitating (Levy-Feldman, 2018).

The study of Islam is a requirement for all Muslim pupils. Islamic education, on the other hand, necessitates teaching and learning that stresses knowledge, skills, practise, and appreciation. This means that students can put their newly acquired knowledge into practise in their daily lives and do so on a constant basis (BPK, 2017). To help students prepare for the workforce, Islamic Education teachers must use 21st-century teaching methods, such as active learning and problem-based learning (Muhammad Talhah Ajmain et al. 2019; Wan Mariana Wan Mohamad & Kamarul Shukri Mat Teh, 2019). When it comes to teaching, teachers need to have the ability to use a variety of teaching strategies to get the best results for their students. Due to its status as one of the most cutting-edge approaches to education in this century (Hase & Kenyon, 2013; Blaschke, 2016), heutagogy should be given more attention in Islamic schools in order to enhance students' sense of agency in their education and teachers' ability to serve as facilitators (Mimi Mohaffyyza et al. al, 2020).

The element of heutagogy is required in order to promote the heutagogy approach in teaching and learning (Norwahida Saamri et al., 2021; Andika Bagus et al., 2019). Mimi Mohaffyyza et al., 2019; Nurul Aisyah Kamrozzaman et al., 2019; Nur Rasham Putra et al., 2019). However, application of heutagogy at the secondary school level remains a mystery to teachers (Chan et al., 2019). In reality, the topic of understanding heutagogy has received little attention, despite earlier research showing that teachers already incorporate heutagogy elements into their instruction (Chan et al., 2019; Preece & Hamed, 2020; Akyldz, 2019; Wong et al., 2019). According to Chan et al. (2019), heutagogy-related research is required to guide teachers in implementing heutagogy practises in schools. A thorough understanding of heutagogy allows for the most effective application of student-centred PdP in all aspects (Hase & Kenyon, 2000). As a result, this study aims to determine the heutagogical elements used among teachers in the

teaching of Islamic Education in secondary schools.

Methodology

This study is a qualitative study that employs a case study design. The design of this study was chosen to enable researchers to conduct in-depth interviews (Yin, 2011). This design is appropriate for examining data and information about practice of heutagogy element in teaching of Islamic education teachers in secondary schools. Four secondary school Islamic education teachers from different states in Malaysia were interviewed. The researcher used purposive sampling techniques to select study participants based on the following criteria, (a) subject matter for Islamic Education, (b) possess a professional qualification in Islamic Education, (c) have a minimum of 5 years of teaching experience, (d) receive teaching-related honours and e) voluntarily interested in participating in the study. This study collected data through structured interviews and document analysis. These interviews are used to address the research

questions because they provide information effectively. Since movement restrictions were still in effect during data collection, interviews with study participants were conducted online via the Google Meet apps with a duration of approximately 40 minutes per session. With the permission of the study participants, interview recordings were uploaded to Google Drive. Additionally, this study employs document analysis to support the interview data by examining photographs of teaching materials and student works. The data from the interviews were categorised, subcategorized, and analysed using coding to generate themes (Miles & Huberman, 2002). Comparing interview data between participants resulted in data triangulation, which enhanced the study's validity and reliability. The researcher used NVivo Plus 12 to ensure more organised and systematic coding management.

Findings

Heutagogical elements were found to be used in the teaching and learning of Islamic Education by the teachers who participated in this research. Findings related to the research question were sorted into the categories and codes given in Table 1.

Table 1: Heutagogical elements in teaching and learning among Islamic Education teachers

Category	Code
Exploration	Assignments are given by teachers.
	Willingness to learn independently
	Assistance with technology usage
Create	Project-based learning
	Invention of products as teaching aids
	Participating in innovation competitions
Collaboration	Designation of a group leader
	Variety of skills
	Worked together with communities
Sharing	Presentation in classroom
	Using social media
	Participating in innovation competitions
Connect	Discussion among peers

Listening to and considering the ideas of others

Reflect

Peer assessment

Teacher evaluation

The analysis of data revealed six main categories for the research question. The element of exploration refers to the process of seeking out and obtaining knowledge through various sources such as books, scholars, experts and information portals on the internet. The teacher sets the stage for students to discover their own learning, for example, by assigning homework to students. IET1 indicated “*I think assignments inspire pupils to conduct research to expand their knowledge. Needs hands on.*” This view is supported by IET3, who believes that teacher-assigned work serves as a stimulus for students' exploratory efforts for their learning. Additionally, the teacher's tasks must provide explicit guideline to ensure that the exploration is purposeful (IET2). The other code in this category is student learning also occurs due to their willingness to independently add information and knowledge. According to IET2 and IET4, students that have an inherent willingness to explore have demonstrated an attitude of self-learning. Another code for this category is assistance with technology usage. It is a fact that the internet and other new technologies have made it easier and faster to do research. All participants in the study agreed that the internet provides learners with a variety of information sources and related applications. IET4 said “*The use of a mobile phone allows for faster access regardless of where you are or what time it is. Students can more easily connect with experts and the community.*”

Element of creation allows the student to become creative with variety of learning approaches that they can create. Learning materials can be created from scratch or adapted for use in teaching and learning activities. Project-based learning is a popular choice among students since it encourages learners to reflect imaginatively. However, while students work on a project, they are also learning (IET4) and make group discussions with peers (IET1). IET2 indicated “*The project must be based on the current lesson*

curriculum, and it has to be fascinating and relevant to the student's perspective.” Moreover, the invention of products to be used as teaching aids is also part of the teacher's efforts to instil in students the element of creation. Teachers and students can utilise teaching aids to help and overcome problems in teaching and learning by creating them (IET4). It is preferable if students can create teaching aids since they can help students enhance their knowledge of lessons (IET4), their thinking abilities, and their recollection of teaching (IET1). Indeed, engaging instructional tools can entice students to participate in learning (IET1; IET2 & IET4). A very experienced teacher IET3 indicated his view on this issue as “*If a student is resourceful and develops a project to aid himself, the information may be useful to others as well. This means that others may benefit from it though.*”

As for the element of collaboration, students are allowed working together to achieve a learning outcome and it is a great way to learn from one another. All participants believed that students gain cooperation abilities if they have a cooperative mindset. There should be an initial designation of a group leader in order to promote a sense of teamwork. A teacher IET4 stated “*Assisting teachers in managing discipline in the classroom is made much easier when students are assigned to be group leaders.*” There was a remarkable finding when it came to demonstrating collaboration through group activities. IET4 stated “*If teachers maintained the same group members throughout the year, students' performance in group activities would improve.*” Students also feel more at ease when they are in the same group, which is why this is important (IET1). In addition, there are different types of skills that can be shown when students work together. With a variety of skills, students are able to do well on the project because the tasks can be split up based on their abilities (IET3 & IET4). Teacher IET4 also indicated that students' motivation would rise because they would be able

to use their abilities to help. With regard to element of collaboration, participants worked together with people from all sorts communities, like parents, neighbourhoods, IPT, academics, and government agencies. IET3 said *“It helps students learn how to get along and socialise when they work together in the living area. Their bond with older people can demonstrate how much they have learned.”* Another participant also stated her views in a similar way: IET1 *“Learning outside of the classroom and working together in the community is a good way for them to learn about the topics on their syllabus.”*

As for the fourth category of ‘Sharing’, three codes were formed. In the general framework of sharing information, whether it be knowledge, talent, or experience, presentations in the classroom are one technique to encourage engagement in learning. All participants agreed that the students who taught them had experience and were able to impart their knowledge through classroom presentations. Commenting in this activity IET1 expressed *“Students show their work and at the same time, they can learn how to stretch effectively in order to connect with their peers.”* In addition, information was shared via TikTok (IET4), Instagram (IET1), Twitter (IET1), and YouTube (IET3) by participants in the study. Students can broaden their network of contacts in this way. IET1 noted *“Sharing via social media allows for sharing with classmates, other school pals, and outside agencies.”* Furthermore, by participating in innovation competitions related to learning aids, students can share their work or products with others. IET1 mentioned *“Taking part in innovation competitions will encourage pupils to learn while also enhancing their mastery of the subject.”*

Activities such as discussion and listening to and considering the ideas of others are encouraged as part of the element of connect. As a result, IET2 emphasised that the discussion session must have a purpose of completing the task so that the dialogue that occurs further increases the students' knowledge and information. Also, it is preferable to run in groups (IET2). Beside this, when students are shown to be able to give and receive other people's opinions, they can develop effective communication skills. A teacher IET4

stated *“When students are given the opportunity to express their thoughts and ideas to others, they feel more confident in their own abilities. A friend's interest in a student's point of view makes them pleased.”*

The last category of the research question is reflection and it comprises of two codes. The reflective activities should include assessments of students and teachers. Participants did a peer assessment to determine the level of student achievement from the student's perspective. Students' evaluations of each other's work (IET1), presentations (IE3), and readings of memorised passages of the Quran (IET1) are all examples of peer evaluation in action. According to IET2 and IET4, having their classmates judge them is more fun than having someone else judge them. IET2 said *“Such assessment can help students work on their weaknesses and flaws, and they can also make them want to compete with each other”*. Similarly, feedback that students give about teaching methods is a sign to the teacher that he should improve his teaching methods. IET1 indicated *“When students express their disagreement with the way a teacher teaches, the teacher has the opportunity to grow and improve their methods.”*

Discussion

This discussion is based on findings of the study on teachers' use of heutagogical elements in their teaching, which are focussed on exploration, creation, reflection, collaboration, sharing, and connection.

Participants acknowledged that the element of exploration is intimately bound to efforts to seek or acquire knowledge from a variety of sources, including books, information portals, and the internet. This study's findings are consistent with that of Nur Ashikin Suhaimi and Nor'ain Mohd Tajudin (2020), Norwahida Saamri et al., (2021), and Andika Bagus Nur Rahma Putra et al. (2019) which discussed how important it is for teachers to encourage exploratory activities in the student learning environment. Participants in the study practised presenting tasks to children as one technique to stimulate exploratory activities. It also demonstrates the importance of teacher

assistance and encouragement as a motivator in the early stages (Carstens et al., 2021). There are, however, students who want to explore on their own. Students' behaviours such as this is an indication of the presence of self-learning. At the same time, exploration becomes easier and faster when kids have access to a smartphone with an internet connection. Mobile phones, according to Noor Muslieah Mustafa Kamal (2021), Narayan et al., (2019), Wong et al., (2019), and Jalaluddin Abdul Malek (2017), are one of the tools for m-learning that lead students to self-learning. Dumping learning resources that aren't bound by time or place makes information and knowledge more accessible. In reality, the internet provides chances for the investigation of new knowledge, allowing teachers and students to collaborate in teaching and learning.

Furthermore, the element of creation is put into action in the teaching of the participants. Participants understand that creativity refers to the work put in to create learning materials based on their own ideas or changes of earlier ideas. Elements such as creation are necessary for students to learn before applying them to real-world challenges (Ordu et al., 2021). Researchers discovered that participants organised in activities that lead to student invention, such as project-based learning, the creation of teaching aids, and the development of innovative products. Students have created a variety of projects, including scrapbooks, beautiful notes, reflection diaries, posters, and mind maps. Students are able to create these creations depending on their point of view through the creation of teaching aids. This is due to the fact that students propose solutions that are appropriate for their level of mastery. In reality, participants further promote students' creativity by bringing them to engage in innovation competitions, equipped with students' experience in developing ideas. Students must create products related with teaching and learning. Besides, students that participate in innovation competitions must follow certain protocols that test their planning, leading, creating, and communication skills. Furthermore, this type of innovation rivalry generates a great deal of competition at the national and worldwide levels.

At the same time, students can learn, add knowledge, and expand existing knowledge.

The emergence of a heutagogy learning environment will also be successful if teachers are able to get their students to work together. This will be achieved if students are able to establish a consensus in groups. A group leader, in addition to working and working together to achieve tasks, can lessen the teacher's task in problems of student control. This is consistent with the findings of Mohd Asnorhisham Adam et al. (2017), who indicated that the group leader serves as a coordinator to arrange learning activities or assignments. In fact, the group leader must also administrate and supervise the group to ensure that there are no misunderstandings and that the assignment is accomplished within the given timeframe (Noor Afzaliza Nazira & Maizatul Haizan, 2021). According to the conclusions of this study, it is appropriate if group members can be maintained for the entire current school year. Teachers will be able to observe the progress of achievement demonstrated by a group from the beginning of a given task until the end by being in the same group. Furthermore, students have established a mutual agreement in the group that has formed as a result of participating in numerous activities together. A group's strength is determined by the variety of skills that enable each member to contribute ideas, skills, and energy based on their particular expertise. Working in groups delivers better results due to the diversity of backgrounds and skills (Noor Afzaliza Nazira & Maizatul Haizan, 2021). Students are able to do things well, have great motivation, and are willing to compete with one another as a result of this privilege. Not only did the study participants build collaboration within the school, but they also established collaboration with the community, including parents, residential areas, IPT, and government and private entities. This should be considered as an effort to expose students to real-life situations as part of the process of gaining experience while learning. According to Noor Afzaliza Nazira and Maizatul Haizan (2021), students that join in outdoor activities that require them to communicate with a lot of people will develop leadership skills, and the activities will receive support from all parties involved. Collaboration

with the community, in fact, allows students to form relationships with people from all backgrounds, share ideas and perspectives with others, and broaden their social networks (Normah Awang Noh & Ain Zahirah Mohd Zahid, 2021).

Sharing is also an element of heutagogy used in participant teaching. Providing information, skills, and experiences between students, professors, and outsiders occurs in a wide variety of methods, including in-class presentations, the use of social media platforms, and innovation competitions. Students can narrate tasks or work done in class through group presentations. With the rise of technology, participants took advantage of the ability to hold online presentations, which provided more opportunities for sharing. According to Nurul Shakirah Mohd Zawawi and Intan Mohammad, the popularity of social media among students has a place as a medium utilised by teachers and students in an effort to exchange educational materials, such as TikTok, Instagram, Twitter, and YouTube (2019). Participants encouraged students to use social media to share lesson materials, either their own or the work of others. Social media can give a network of sharing that is easily, swiftly, and broadly available; students can also receive feedback from others. At the same time, cooperation requires the contact of human beings, which is also one of the elements of heutagogy. Participants also believed that when they engaged in learning aid innovation competitions, students may discuss ideas about their innovation work or products. This method might encourage students and teachers to communicate in order to discuss thoughts and opinions on the issues at stake (Mohd Ridzuan Padzil, 2020). This communication not only boosts students' confidence, but also encourages them to develop self-skills, think more extensively, and express arguments, ideas, ask questions, and solve problems with confidence. Of course, teachers' and students' relationships will be more positive and close.

Therefore, students are encouraged to come up with ideas and points of view, as well as to be open to accepting the viewpoints of others, in order to establish an element of connection in

teaching. Suzana Abd Mutalib and Mohammad Zeeree Kanreng (2017) stated students' ability to give opinions in the fifth level of the cognitive hierarchy of thinking skills, which is analyzing. Students' proclivity to express their own viewpoints demonstrates that they successfully employ thinking skills strategies in classroom activities and daily life (Peng & Zul Hazmi Hamad, 2018). Participants frequently demonstrated an open approach toward students' perspectives by listening to and considering them as thoroughly as possible. When teachers do not limit students' views or opinions, their thinking skills will improve (Nadia Abdul Rahim et al., 2021). Furthermore, students demonstrated an openness policy by accepting and not dismissing the thoughts and ideas of their peers. This is consistent with the views of Ainun Rahmah Iberahim et al. (2017), who stated that giving students the opportunity to think and express their thoughts, as well as thoughtful ideas, in teaching and learning activities can prepare them to confront the difficulties of 21st century globalisation.

Following that, participants incorporated the aspect of reflection into the teaching and learning process to ensure that both parties met the objectives. Participants stressed the importance of analysis as a strategy for students to improve their own weaknesses while also influencing others. Participants highlighted the need of student involvement in evaluation, such as doing peer assessments. This alternative evaluation is designed to stimulate student participation by evaluating Quranic verse recitation and awarding marks during group work presentations. Ongoing assessments will allow students to improve on their deficiencies and shortcomings. At the same time, the knowledge and experience gained can be used to help others correct their problems and inadequacies. Furthermore, any constructive criticism provided by a peer might assist weaker students in improving their thinking abilities or experimenting with different learning approaches (Nadia Abdul Rahim et al., 2021). Students' ability to throw and embrace criticism shows their inventiveness in creating ideas and suggestions for their learning (Rafidah Yatim @ Mohd Yatim, & Mohd Safiee Idris, 2016). According to Colognesi et al. (2020), peer evaluation fosters an

internal reciprocal relationship between the assessor and the individual being evaluated thus allowing both parties to learn from one another. Reciprocal feedback will help both parties learn how to improve themselves, boost confidence, and foster student rivalry. From another perspective, participants considered student feedback as a reflection of a reflection on the teacher's teaching. Nonetheless, the participants had used student comments as a guide to enhance teaching methods in the very same way that Irwan Fariza Sidik et al. (2018).

Conclusion

According to the findings of the research, Islamic Education teachers have adopted elements of heutagogy into their teaching. IEs Creative GPIs diversify teaching activities that prioritise student-centered learning. IEs provides students with the opportunity to explore new information and abilities as they prepare to meet the educational needs of the twenty-first century. GPI, on the other hand, is open-minded and works to develop their knowledge and skills in order to meet today's educational needs. Implementing a heutagogical approach gives teachers new options for creating a more successful educational environment. These findings have an impact on many parties, including parents and the community, by demonstrating that education is a shared duty in establishing collaborative programmes to improve the quality of student learning. In fact, such learning can train students with lifelong learning skills.

Reference

- Ainun Rahmah Iberahim, Zamri Mahamod, & Wan Muna Ruzanna Wan Mohammad. (2017). 21th century learning and the influence of attitude, motivation and achievements malay language secondary school student). *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Melayu*, 7(2), 77-88.
- Andika Bagus Nur Rahma Putra, Haris Anwar Syafrudie, Jailani Md Yunos, Ahmad Mursyidum Nidhom, Azhar Ahmad Smaragdina, & Andrew Irfano Sembiring. (2019). Analysis of the Necessity for Heutagogical Approach Through 4Cs Skills as Innovation for Vocational Lectures in the Education 4.0. 379(Veic), 362-371. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.191217.059>
- Bahagian Pendidikan Kurikulum. (2017). *Kurikulum standard sekolah menengah (KSSM) kerangka kurikulum mata pelajaran*. Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia.
- Blaschke, L. M., & Hase, S. (2016). Heutagogy: A Holistic Framework for Creating Twenty-First-Century Self-determined Learners [Book Chapter]. *Lecture Notes in Educational Technology*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-662-47724-3_2
- Carstens, K. J., Mallon, J. M., Bataineh, M., & Al-Bataineh, A. (2021). Effects of Technology on Student Learning *TOJET: The Turkish Online Journal of Educational Technology* 20(1).
- Colognesi, S., Vassart, C., Blondeau, B., & Coertjens, L. (2020). Formative peer assessment to enhance primary school pupils' oral skills: Comparison of written feedback without discussion or oral feedback during a discussion. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 67, 100917.
- Coomey, M., & Stephenson, J. (2001). It's all about Dialogue, Involvement, Support and Control. *Teaching and Learning Online*.
- Hase. (2001) "Moving from andragogy to heutagogy : implications for VET," Proc. Res. to Real. Putt. VET Res. to Work Aust. Vocat. Educ. Train. Res. Assoc., no. January 2001, 2001.
- Hase, S., & Kenyon, C. (2000). From andragogy to heutagogy. *Ulti-BASE In-Site*.
- Hase, S., & Kenyon, C. (2013). The nature of learning. *Self-determined learning: Heutagogy in action*, 19-35.
- Huberman, M., & Miles, M. B. (2002). *The qualitative researcher's companion*. Sage.
- Ibnu Khaldun. (2002). *Mukadimah Ibn Khaldun*. Dewan Bahasa dan Pustaka.
- Irwan Fariza Sidik, Mohd Mahzan Awang, & Abdul Razaq Ahmad. (2018). Sokongan

- Persekitaran Sosial di Pelbagai Jenis Sekolah Menengah dalam Meningkatkan Kemahiran Insaniah Pelajar. *Jurnal Pendidikan Malaysia SI 1 (1)(2018)*: 67, 76.
- Fisk, P. (2017). *Education 4.0... the future of learning will be dramatically different, in school and throughout life*. <https://www.peterfisk.com/2017/01/future-education-young-everyone-taught-together/>
- Jalaluddin Abdul Malek. (2017). The impact of heutagogy education through Telecentre in Smart Village (Sv). *e-BANGI*, 14(2), 112-125.
- Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia. (2013). *Pelan Pembangunan Pendidikan Malaysia 2013-2025*. Putrajaya: Kementerian Pendidikan Malaysia.
- Levy-Feldman, I. (2018). The good teacher for the twenty-first century: a “mentoring teacher” with heutagogical skills. *International Journal of Mentoring and Coaching in Education*, 7(2), 177-190. <https://doi.org/10.1108/IJMCE-10-2017-0067>
- Mimi Mohaffyza Mohamad, Foong, L. M., Alias Masek, Heong, Y. M., & Andika Bagus Nur Rahma Putra. (2020). Practices of heutagogical activities among Malaysia technical university students [Article]. *International Journal of Scientific and Technology Research, Practices of heutagogical activities among Malaysia technical university students*. <https://www.scopus.com/inward/record.uri?eid=2-s2.0-85085535154&partnerID=40&md5=89e1ebad45c9f64b10e1beab4706a933>
- Mohd Asnorhisham Adam, & Abdul Rahim Hamdan. (2017). Pendekatan pengajaran secara berkumpulan dalam program pemulihan khas bahasa melayu. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Melayu – JPBM*, Vol. 7(Mei), 66-73.
- Mohd Ridzuan Padzil, Aidah Abd Karim, & Hazrati Husnin. (2020). PAK 21: Pembelajaran berasaskan projek dalam mata pelajaran reka bentuk dan teknologi (RBT). *Jurnal Refleksi Kepemimpinan*(JILID III).
- Muhammad Ayisy Baharudin, & Mohd Ashraf Ibrahim. (2019). Kesediaan pelaksanaan pengajaran abad ke 21 dalam kalangan guru pelatih sejarah IPG zon selatan. *Jurnal Penyelidikan Sains Sosial*, 2(5), 32-42.
- Muhammad Talhah Ajmain, Aminudin Hehsan, & Ahmad Marzuki Mohamad. (2019). Learning and facilitation (PdPc) Islamic Education in Industrial Revolution 4.0. *Journal of Research in Psychology*, 1(3), 13-17.
- Moore, R. L. (2020). Developing lifelong learning with heutagogy: contexts, critiques, and challenges. *Distance Education*, 41(3), 381-401.
- Nadia Abdul Rahim, Nor Aqilah Meor Fadzir, Nur Adilah Hani Zaimal, Firli Fairulyzan Arias Yahaya, Zatul Iffah Zainol, & Mohd Razimi Husin. (2021). Implikasi Gaya Pembelajaran Koperatif Subjek Sains Bagi Murid Tahap Dua di Sekolah Kebangsaan Bandar Baru Rawang. *Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 3(2), 57-66.
- Narayan, V., Herrington, J., & Cochrane, T. (2019). Design principles for heutagogical learning Implementing student-determined learning with mobile and social media tools. *Australasian Journal of Educational Technology*, 35(3).
- Nur Ashikin Suhaimi, & Nor'ain Mohd Tajudin. (2020). Mensinergikan pengajaran matematik peringkat universiti melalui pendekatan heutagogi ke arah kurikulum tersedia masa hadapan. *International Journal of Education and Pedagogy*, 2(3), 56-69.
- Normah Awang Noh, & Ain Zahirah Mohd Zahid. (2021). Manfaat Penglibatan Dalam Kesukarelawanan Terhadap Pembangunan Kemahiran dan Sosial Dalam Kalangan Mahasiswa Persatuan Kelab Penyayang. *The Malaysian Journal of Social Administration*, 15, 67-84.
- Norwahida Saamri, Safinah Nawawi & Ruzanna Ramli. (2021). Student Acceptance Level toward the Use of Online Facilities to Support Flexible Learning Activities

- Based on the Design Elements of the Heutagogical Approach. *International Journal of Modern Education*, 3(8), 35-48.
<https://doi.org/10.35631/ijmoe.38004>
- Noor Afzaliza Nazira Ibrahim, & Maizatul Haizan Mahbob. (2021). Keterampilan Peribadi Pelajar Sebagai Satu Bentuk Kemahiran Komunikasi dan Kepentingannya dalam Pasaran Dunia Pekerjaan. *Jurnal Komunikasi: Malaysian Journal of Communication*, Jilid 37(1), 209-226.
<https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.17576/JKMJC-2021-3701-12>
- Noor Muslieah Mustafa Kamal, Zaharah Hussin, Abdul Muhsien Sulaiman, & Nurul Nadia Abd Latib. (2021). Application Of Heutagogy In Home-Based Learning Use Of M-Learning. *Journal of Islamic Educational Research*, 7, 44-65.
- Nurul Shakirah Mohd Zawawi, & Intan Shafinaz Mohammad. (2019). Media Sosial Sebagai Medium Perkongsian Maklumat Dan Pembelajaran Kendiri Dalam Pengajaran Dan Pembelajaran. *E-Jurnal Liga Ilmu Serantau 2019: Malaysia Indonesia (Lis 2019)*, 1, 42-60.
- Ordu, U. B.-A. (2021). The Role of Teaching and Learning Aids/Methods in a Changing World. *Bulgarian Comparative Education Society*.
- Peng, C. F., & Zul Hazmi Hamad. (2018). Higher Order of Thinking Skills in Teaching and Learning Malay Language through Questioning Technique. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Melayu*, 8(2), 1-12.
- Rafidah Yatim @ Mohd Yatim, & Mohd Safiee Idris. (2016). Pelaksanaan Pengajaran Dan Pembelajaran Perniagaan Dan Keusahawanan Dalam Kalangan Guru Kemahiran Hidup Sekolah Rendah Di Daerah Batu Pahat Dari Persepsi Pelajar. *Online Journal for TVET Practitioners*, 1(1).
- Suzana Abd Mutalib, & Mohammad Zeeree Kanreng. (2017). Pelaksanaan KBAT dalam pentaksiran formatif bagi slot Tunjang Komunikasi Bahasa Malaysia: Kajian kes. *Jurnal Pendidikan Awal Kanak-kanak Kebangsaan*, 6(1), 18-33.
- Wan Mariana Wan Mohamad, & Kamarul Shukri Mat Teh. (2019). Pembelajaran Abad ke-21 dalam Al-Quran: Satu Manual Pendidikan Istimewa daripada Allah. *Journal of Educational Research & Indegenous Studies*, 2(1), 192-201.
- Wong, K. T., Yeop, M. A., & Muhammad, M. M. B. (2019). Modelling the factor influencing the implementation of mobile-heutagogical practices among teachers: An application of invariance multi-group structural model [Review]. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*.
<https://doi.org/10.26803/ijlter.18.12.1>
- Yin, R. K. (2011). *Applications of case study research*. Sage.