The Importance Of Tourism Awareness Groups In West Halmahera Regency Tourism Development Policies

Thamrin Husain*[1], Saiful Deni *[2] Zubair Saing*[3]

1. Lecture of Public Administration, FISIP Universitas Muhammadiyah Maluku Utara
2. Professor of Public Administration, FISIP Universitas, Muhammadiyah Maluku Utara
3. Lecture of Engineering, FATEK Universitas, Muhammadiyah Maluku Utara

Abstract

Tourism development in the West Halmahera Regency, North Maluku Province, requires a suitable and sustainable approach to preserve the civility and continuity of behaviours instilled and enforced by parents, religious leaders, and community leaders. This study aims to comprehend the Tourism Awareness Group's engagement in the Policy for Development of Tourism Destinations in Tuada and Bobanehena Villages, Jailolo District, West Halmohera Regency. This research employs a qualitative methodology and is constructivist. This study demonstrates that the Tourism Awareness Group in Tuada Village and Bobanehena Village is aware of its tourism potential, allowing for the development of particular measures to facilitate tourists' entry to West Halmahera Regency during their vacations. In addition, there are sociocultural obstacles in tourist growth, and the Tourism Awareness Group is conscious that it must continue to foster cooperation with essential stakeholders in West Halmahera Regency's tourism development.

Keywords: Tourism Awareness Group, Tourism Development Policy, and Tourism Village

INTRODUCTION

A territory or region's growth is closely related to the local culture. Therefore, developing the region within the framework of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia is challenging (NKRI). With residents dispersed across the islands and waters of the archipelago, which runs from Sabang in Aceh to Merauke in Papua, there is no need for a rigorous development strategy.

There are at least five possible development planning models in Indonesia (explanation of Law Number 25 the Year 2004): political, technocratic, participative, top-down (top-down), and bottom-up (bottom-up). The political approach considers the President/Regional Head election a planning process since voters base their decision on the development programs proposed by each candidate for President/Regional Head. Therefore, the development plan is the medium-term implementation of the development objectives proposed by the President/Head of Regions during the campaign.

Planning with a technocratic approach is conducted by the institution or work unit that is functionally responsible for utilizing scientific methodologies and procedures. Participatory planning involves including all stakeholders in the development process. Their participation is intended to foster ambitions and a sense of belonging. At the same time, the top-down and bottom-up planning approaches are implemented following government levels. The outcomes of the top-down and bottom-up process plans are harmonized through national, provincial, regency/city, district, and village-level discussions.

North Maluku Province parents, religious leaders, and community leaders must have instilled civility and continuity of habits in

their children's lives for tourism development to have the correct and sustainable strategy as a foundation. North Maluku Province, which has a total area of 140,255.36 km2 (76.2% water and 23.73 % land) and is comprised of 395 large and small islands (64 of which are inhabited and 331 of which are deserted), has abundant tourism potential and can serve as a source of regional income.

The potential for tourism in the North Maluku region is bolstered by natural features and cultural artefacts from the past. It enables the development of cultural and archaeological, nature, and maritime tourism in the North Maluku region. The potential for natural tourism includes forest tourism, marine tourism like beach tourism and marine park tourism, agricultural tourism, and nature reserve tourism, among others. Most historical tourism in the form of forts or historical heritage monuments may be found in all North Maluku cities/regencies, including West Halmahera.

Historically, West Halmahera Regency was once known as North Maluku Regency; its name was changed following the separation based on Law No. 1 of 2003. Jailolo is the capital of West Halmahera Regency. The size of West Halmahera Regency is 2,080.21 km2 and comprises 74 islands. Geographically, West Halmahera is situated between 00 48' and 10 48' north latitude and 1270 16' 00" and 1270 16' 01" east longitude.

Jailolo Bay, Kahatola Waterfall, Bidadari Bird Expedition, Mangrove Forest, Bobo Beach, Bobanehena Beach, Tuda Beach, Babua Island, and Pastafiri Island are a few of the many tourist attractions in West Halmahera Regency, which are distributed throughout several subdistricts. In 2020, there were 80 foreign tourists in West Halmahera Regency, representing a decline of 82.03 per cent compared to 2019. In the meantime, there were 6,910 domestic tourists in West Halmahera Regency.

There are 69 lodging service providers in West Halmahera Regency in 2020, 58 accommodations or 84.05 per cent, are in the Jailolo sub-district, 7.24 per cent are in the South Jailolo sub-district, 4.34 per cent are in the Ibu sub-district, and 2.89 per cent are in the Loloda sub-district. In 2020, the total number of available rooms will reach 308 units, totalling 331 beds. One way to boost the regional economy, including that of West Halmahera Regency, is to maximize the potential of the tourism industry.

In addition to being supported by proper facilities and infrastructure, the development of tourist objects must also be equipped with the appropriate policies so that the tourism industry can best develop and remain competitive. The involvement of tourism-driving groups or Tourist Awareness Groups in creating tourism development policies in West Halmahera Regency must thus be investigated in depth.

Definition of the issue

Based on the preceding description, the following issues can be identified:

1. How is the Tourism Awareness group involved in the West Halmahera Regency Tourism Development Policy?
2. What challenges does the Tourist Development Policy in West Halmahera Regency face?
3. What methods does the Tourism Awareness Group require to increase the tourism potential in West Halmahera Regency?

RESEARCH METHOD

This study employs a constructivist methodology; in the ontological explanation of the constructivist paradigm, reality is an individual-created social fabrication. However, the truth of social reality is relative, as it relates to a particular situation deemed significant by social actors (Hidayat, in Bungin, 2011:11).

Since its introduction by Peter L. Berger and Thomas Luckman in their work titled "The Social Construction of Reality: A Treatise in the Sociology of Knowledge," the term construction of social reality (social construction of reality) has become well-known (1966). Through their acts and interactions, he depicts social processes in which individuals continuously co-create a reality that is owned and experienced subjectively (Bungin, 2011:13).

This research's data analysis focuses primarily on describing the results of interviews, observations, and documentation studies. The collected data will be examined qualitatively and documented in descriptive language. According to Miles, Huberman, and Saldana (2014: 14), the data analysis technique utilized in this study consists of four simultaneous flows of activities: data collection, data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing/verification. This type of study is called interactive analysis.

A. Policy Definition

Public policy consists of governmental actions and inactions (Dye, Thomas R. 2013: 3). The government performs a variety of tasks, including establishing rules for resolving conflicts in the community, rallying people to care about conflicts in neighbouring communities, offering various awards and services to community members, and levying taxes. Consequently, public policy governs behaviour, organizes government operations, distributes benefits or collects taxes.

In the meantime, Gerald E. Caiden defines public policymaking as the general decision of several concerns about a large number of people and their remedies; public policy is also an important field of study within public administration. This research falls under government jurisdiction, particularly public entities (Caiden, 1982: 51). Regarding policy studies, Randal B. Ripley argues: "Policy

studies must be characterized ambiguously across fields.

Policy studies are neither the product of a single discipline nor designed to produce a new one. In addition, policy studies do not solely concentrate on policy concerns utilized by policymakers, policy implementers, or other policy actors. Policy studies have a link with political science by definition. Nonetheless, it occasionally focuses on particular policy challenges and is utilized in various ways by distinct policy players (Ripley, 1985: 6).

B. Concept of Policy Formulation

According to Guy B. Peters (in Nugroho, 2012: 544), the official does not need to conduct a proper and accountable policy analysis process because he is an expert in policymakers. That is a significant number of professional bureaucrats whose purpose is to create public policies without policy formulation. They have transitioned from "professionals in public policy" to "public policy shamans" (Nugroho, 2012: 544).

Solichin A. Wahab (2014: 75) emphasizes that, in the practice of policymaking, three theories of decision-making are the most commonly explored in the literature on public policy. Comprehensive rational theory, incremental theory, and integrated observation theory are the theories under dispute. According to R.S. Milne (1972), this complete rational paradigm will be challenging to implement in emerging nations. Because the information/statistical data is insufficient, there are insufficient ready-made theoretical tools for developing country conditions. The cultural ecology in which the decision-making system operates is unsupportive; bureaucracies in developing countries are typically weak and incapable of supplying rational elements in decision-making (in Wahab, 2014: 78).

Incremental theory in decision-making reflects a theory that avoids many concerns that must be explored (as in comprehensive rational

theory) while describing more of the ways government officials make day-to-day decisions.

This gradual awareness, according to Lindbloom, is a defining characteristic of the decision-making process in heterogeneous societies such as the United States. Decisions and policies result from give-and-take and mutual trust among the people involved in the decision-making process. In a society with a pluralistic structure, this incremental approach is safer from a political standpoint, as it will be easier to reach a consensus if the issues debated by the various groups are merely attempting to modify existing programs, as opposed to policy issues involving "all or nothing" radical changes.

Etzioni (in Wahab, 2014, p. 78) presents the following illustration of the integrated observation theory: suppose we want to create a global weather satellite observation system. A rational-comprehensive strategy will aim to undertake a large-scale survey of weather conditions utilizing cameras capable of conducting frequent surveys and explorations of the entire sky surface. Such an endeavour would produce extensive data on the probability of snowfall, but analyzing such data, for instance, would be difficult (spots of cloud formation that can develop into storms and deliver rain to dry areas). It requires a great deal of money, time, and effort.

In the meantime, the incremental method will strive to concentrate on regions where comparable patterns have emerged in the recent past and possibly adjacent regions. Thus, these observations will disregard any cloud types and formations that may require serious consideration if they occur in unexpected locations. According to Etzioni, the aforementioned integrated observation model will permit decision-makers to apply comprehensive rational and incremental theories in diverse scenarios.

In theory, policy actors are those who are constantly and must be involved in every public policy analysis process, both as formulators and pressure groups who are always active and proactive in their interactions within the context of public policy analysis (Howlet and Ramesh, 1995; Weiner and Vining, 1989 in Muhlis Madani 2011:37-38). According to Charles O. Jones (in Wahab, 2014: 88), at least four kinds or sorts of actors (actors) are active in the policy process. These include rationalists, technicians, incrementalists, and reformers.

Furthermore, James Anderson's books consider who is involved in policy formulation (2003:46-66). The participants in the policymaking process can be split into two groups: formal and informal actors. Official players include government agents (bureaucracy), the president (executive), and the legislative and judicial branches. Meanwhile, the category of unofficial actors consists of interest groups, political parties, and private persons.

C. Tourism Theory

Tourism is defined by Mathieson and Wall (1982) as the temporary movement of people to a destination outside their usual place of residence or employment, the activities they engage in during their stay at the destination, and the facilities provided to meet their needs both during the journey and at the destination. Yoeti (2008) defines tourism as a temporary journey from one location to another that is undertaken without the idea of attempting to earn a living there but rather for the sake of sightseeing, recreation, or the fulfilment of other non-economic goals.

In the meantime, according to Law No. 10 of 2009 regarding Tourism, tourism is defined as various types of tourism activities supported by various facilities and services given by the community, business people, the government, and local governments. As intended, the term "tourism" refers to travel

activities carried out by a person or group of people for the aim of recreation, personal development, or studying the uniqueness of tourist attractions visited for a temporary period; persons who engage in tourism are known as tourists.

Four factors must be addressed when developing tourism products. The following elements influence the tourism offer (Yoeti, 1996):

1. Attraction In order to attract travellers, a tourist destination (hence referred to as DTW) must have natural, communal, and cultural attractions.
2. Accessible (transport) indicates that both domestic and international travellers can readily reach tourism spots.
3. Amenities are one of the needs for tourist destinations in order for tourists to feel at home or to remain at home in tourist locations (institutional); tourists visit and seek out tourist destinations more frequently if they feel secure (tourism protection) and are protected there.

In the case of a tourism offering business, a tourism object must meet three criteria to be of interest to visitors: 1) something to see (tourism objects must have something that can be seen or made into a spectacle by tourist visitors); 2) something to do (so that tourists who do tourism there can do something practical to give a feeling of pleasure, happiness, relax, in the form of recreational facilities); and 3) something to eat (so that tourists who do tourism there can eat valuable something to give a feeling of pleasure (facilities for shopping tourists, which are generally a characteristic or icon of the area, so they can be used as souvenirs).

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Tourism Awareness Group Participation

Tourism awareness organizations' role in developing tourism in the villages of Tuda and Bobanehena is exceptionally substantial. According to Sofyan Labuha, Head of the Bobanehena Village Tourism Awareness Group, historical, economic, and religious values have served as the basis for decisions about tourism development programs in Bobanehena Village. In making judgments on development planning, particularly tourism development, Sofyan's proposed value system aligns with Iswan, the head of the village, and Risal Abdurrahman, the village's consultative body.

The objective of the three persons' value bases is identical, as they were previously involved in tourism awareness groups to establish the Bobanehena Tourism Village. According to Iswan Idrus, Head of Bobanehena Village, community members who reside in the Bobanehena Traditional Village must use the appropriate technique to elevate the community's dignity. Therefore, tourism is the best option based on historical, economic, and religious considerations.

Regarding the value that became the basis for the approval of the tourism program proposed by the Village Consultative Body and the Tuada Village Government, the Chair of the Tuada Village Tourism Awareness Group, Hilman Malik, stated, "The community in our village agrees that for the development of tourist destinations, we must not forget the historical value and strengthen the economic value." As chairman of the Village-Owned Enterprises, Udin Bakar sent the same message. The primary factor influencing the formulation of tourism development initiatives is economic value.

Economically, the neighbourhood got various benefits before and after the opening of the Pejuang Tuada Beach tourist attraction. Historically, individuals only engaged in gardening and fishing. Now, people can get additional revenue simply by selling food and beverages. According to Udin, "there is

economic value since, once tourists arrive, the people who sell will receive additional revenue associated with economic life."

The village chief of Tuda expressed the same opinion. Iksan Faruk, the head of Tuada Village, stated, "The four tourism development initiatives we offer are acceptable to them for their historical and economic significance. The inhabitants of Tuada Village are well aware that they had local heroes such as Banau and Po'en. They battled against the Dutch and established Tanjung Pejuang, a meeting and movement location. Additionally, the economic value is the increase in sales revenue that has a beneficial effect on them.

Indeed, history has a tremendous appeal. In other words, patriotic traces and spirit or fighting spirit can be restored through reminiscing about the past. Examining history is not the same as attempting to comprehend a specific period's sociocultural and political occurrences. Therefore, remembering history serves as a springboard for entering the spirit of the eras as they lived and evolved. It is acceptable for history to have its value in people's memories.

Obstacles Encountered

There are at least three hurdles to tourism development in Tuada Village and Bobanehena Village, as determined by the community's collective experiences. Foreign tourists who wish to enjoy the magnificent beaches of Tuada Village and Bobanehena Beach typically wear bikini-style swimwear or even just underwear, which locals still consider inappropriate. The wearing of clothing by tourists from outside the village region produces a clash of values with the local populace due to the customs of the travellers' home countries.

Second, the residents of Tuada and Bobanehena Villages desire their coastline to become a tourist attraction since it can give them historical, cultural, and economic benefits; yet, they have not been able to accept the new values introduced by tourists. In other

languages, the inhabitants of Tuada and Bobanehena Villages feel intimidated by the presence of tourists who do not yet share their knowledge of the laws and values that govern the community.

Even while the Village Head and the Village Consultative Body Management are aware of a discrepancy between the values held by the community and those brought in by tourists from outside the village, they are nonetheless preoccupied with work or other responsibilities. Due to the repetitive and time-consuming nature of village activities, the draft for drafting village ordinances is sometimes merely a discussion without any actual actions to follow.

Tourism Planning Strategy

The approach to tourism development in Bobanehena Village and Tuada Village begins with the formulation of Village Regulations about Etiquette or Courtesy for visitors to the tourist village. The Tuada Village Tourism Awareness Group leader, Hilman Malik, stated, "The village head's regulation on etiquette is significant, but those in charge have not decided it." Sofyan Labuha, the leader of the Bobanehena Village Tourism Awareness Group, stated, "It is essential to have a village head ordinance regarding karma so that tourists can dress following the community's customs and traditions. In essence, the Village Head Regulation is a policy to safeguard the indigenous Bobanehena people's indigenous knowledge of tourism development.

Second, presenting tour packages based on the indigenous peoples' local knowledge. Sofyan Labuha, head of the Bobanehena Village Tourism Awareness Group, stated, "We have a great deal of social capital that can be adopted as a tour package, such as the Oke Sou tradition or the proposal of a girl entering puberty staying at home for seven days, taking medicine for her health, and using powder for facial care.

Moreover, according to Sofyan, "we once packed a full-day excursion at the cost of Rp 600,000, - with an itinerary of events; pick up guests in the early morning using dances, enjoy the sunrise, breakfast, Kololi dehe or the ritual of turning the cape, throw coins on the mythical rock, Diving continues to climb into the forest or mountain, lunch in the forest with jaha rice or rice that has been directly burned in the forest. Bamboo, returning to the guesthouse and fishing at night with hohate whose primary ingredients are gaba-gaba or long bamboo."

Third, foster cooperation with other local and national players, such as community leaders and business owners. According to Sofyan Labuha of the Bobanehena Village Tourism Awareness Group, "we have a relationship with Ms Diyah Kesuma, a significant owner and entrepreneur in the transportation services industry. Sofyan stated that Ms Dyah owns numerous travel agencies and has attracted guests to Bobanehena Village.

In fostering cooperation, mutual regard is a crucial success factor. Respect for others demonstrates profound regard for those well-known to the general populace. Recognition happens because there is typically a meeting or encounter, including contact and even conversation regarding social phenomena that have arisen in both the present and the past. According to Mianarti Amir, the Village Local Assistant, the connection between village officials, the Village Consultative Body, and the community is currently excellent. They frequently debate and provide input on problems that arise in the village.

CONCLUSION

The conclusion of the research on the Urgency of Tourism Awareness Groups' Involvement in Tourism Development Policies in West Halmahera Regency is as follows:

1. The Tourism Awareness Group in Tuada Village and Bobanehena Village is aware of their tourism potential; therefore, they require particular strategies, such as travel offers based on the provided packages and prices, to make it easier for tourists to access West Halmahera Regency for their vacations.
2. In Tuada Village and Bobanehena Village, there are sociocultural restraints about the attire or attire worn by foreign tourists when touring, scuba diving, or swimming that receive considerable consideration from the indigenous inhabitants of the Tourism Village in the issue.
3. The Tourism Awareness Group is aware of the need to maintain cooperation with hotel, travel, culinary, and tourist guide entrepreneurs, as well as the government and other relevant stakeholders on both the local and national levels, to promote tourism development in West Halmahera Regency.

RECOMMENDATION

1. The need to construct socially and culturally sensitive tour packages based on local tourism potential in the form of field trips to make it easier for tourists to choose and determine the length of their stay, the type of lodging required, and the attractions or acts they will observe.
2. The need for village regulations to be formulated in conjunction with village officials and religious leaders, community leaders, traditional leaders, youth leaders, and women leaders regarding the standards of clothing or clothing and the conduct of tourists while engaging in tourism activities in a traditional tourist village.
3. Tourism awareness groups must continue to strengthen cooperation with hotel, travel, culinary, and tourist guide entrepreneurs, as well as the government and other relevant stakeholders, at both the local and

national levels, in West Halmahera Regency tourism development.

REFERENCES

1. Abdullah, Irwan, 2009, Konstruksi dan Reproduksi Kebudayaan, Pustaka Pelajar, Yogyakarta.
2. Agranoff, Robert& MCGuire, Michael, 2003, Collaborative Public Management, New Strategies fo Local Governments, Georgetown University Press, Washington D.C.US.
3. Akib, Haedar, 2011, Mencermati Heuristik Transformasi Organisasi: Mereaktualisasi Perilaku Kretaif Manusia Melalui Pendekatan Knowledge Management, Pidato Pengukuhan Jabatan Guru Besar, Universitas Negeri Makassar.
4. Alister Mathieson and Geoffrey Wall, 1982, Tourism Economic, Physical, And Social Impacts, Harlow: Longman.
5. Anderson, James, E, 2003, Public Policymaking, An Introduction, Texas A&M University, WADSWORTH, Cengage Learning, Boston, USA.
6. Ansell Chris& Gash Alison, 2007, Collaborative Governance in Theory and Practice Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of the Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory, Inc. All rights reserved
7. Arikunto, Suharsimi, 2002, Prosedur Penelitian, Suatu Pendekatan Praktek, Edisi Revisi V, Rineka Cipta, Jakarta.
8. A, Yoeti, Oka. Edisi Revisi 1996, Pengantar Ilmu Pariwisata, Penerbit Angkasa,
    a. Bandung
9. A, Yoeti, Oka. 2008. Ekonomi Pariwisata: Introduksi, Informasi, dan Implementasi, Penerbit Kompas. Jakarta
10. Balogh, Stephen et.al (2011) An Integrative Framework for Collaborative Governance, Oxford University Press on behalf of the Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory, London, UK.
11. Birkland, Thomas A, 2011, An Introduction to the Policy Process, Theories, Concepts, and Models of Public Policy Making, Routledge Taylor& Francis Group, London And New York.
12. Bungin, H.M. Burhan, 2011, Konstruksi Sosial media Massa, Kencana Prenada Media Group, Jakarta.
13. Bryce, Herrington, J. 2005, Player In the Public Policy Process, Nonprofits as Sosial Capital and Agents, Palgrave, Macmillan, New York.
14. Caiden, Gerald.E 1982, Public Administration, Second Edition, Palisades Publishers, California.
15. Considini, Mark, 1994, Public Policy, A Critical Approach, Macmillan Education Australia PTY LTD, Melbourne.
16. Dahrendorf, Ralf. 1959. Class and Class Conflict In Industrial Society, Stanford University Press, California.
17. Donahue, John.D& Zeckhauser, Richard.J. 2011, Collaborative Governance, Private Role For Public Goals In Turbulent Times, Published by Princeton University Press, 41 William Street, New Jersey.
18. Dye, Thomas R. 2013, Understanding Public Policy, Fourteenth Edition, Pearson Education, Inc.
19. Gerston, Larry.N 1983, Making Public Policy, From Conflict to Resolution, Scott, Foresman and Company, Glenview, Illinois.
20. Guigan, Jim.Mc. 2004, Rethinking Cultural Policy, Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication.
21. Hadinoto, Kusudianto. 1996. Perencanaan Pengembangan Destinasi Pariwisata.
    a. Jakarta: UI Press

1217 Journal of Positive School Psychology

22. Haryanto, 1991. Elit, Massa, dan Konflik, Suatu Bahasan Awal, PAU-Studi Sosial UGM, Yogyakarta.

23. Haryatmoko, 2003, Etika Politik dan Kekuasaan, Kompas, Jakarta.

24. Heidenheimer, Arnold.J. Heclo, Hugh. And Adams,Carolyn, T. 1990, Comparative Public Policy, ST. Martins Press, New York

25. Hogwood, Brian.W and Gunn, Lewis.A 1984, Policy Analysis for the real World, Oxford University Press.

26. Hill, Michael, 1993, The Policy Process, A reader, University of Newcastle, Harvester-Wheatsheat.

27. Hill, Michael, 2005, The Public Policy Process, Fourth Edition, Pearson Longman, England.

28. Islamy, M. Irfan, 2004, Prinsip-Prinsip Perumusan Kebijaksanaan Negara, Bumi Aksara, Jakarta.

29. John Wanna &Janine O'Flynn (2008), Collaborative governance : a new era of public policy in Australia, Published by ANU E Press, The Australian National University, Canberra ACT 0200, Australia.

30. Kay, Adrian, 2006, The Dynamics Of Public Policy, Theory and Evidence, Edward Elgar, Cheltenham, UK, Northampton, MA, USA

31. Keban, Yeremias,T, 2014, Enam Dimensi Strategis Administrasi Publik, Konsep teori, dan Isu, Edisi Ketiga, Gavamedia, Yogyakarta.

32. Kirk Emerson, Tina Nabatchi, Stephen Balogh, 2011, An Integrative Framework for Collaborative Governance, Published by Oxford University Press on behalf of the Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory,

33. Lawrence, W, Neuman, 2013, Metodologi Penelitian Sosial: pendekatan Kualitatif dan Kuantitatif, Edisi Ke 7, Indeks, Jakarta.

34. Lester, James. P, and Stewart, Joseph. Jr, 2000, Public Policy, An Evolutionary Approach, Second Edition, Wadsworth-Thomson Learning, Belmont USA.

35. Madani, Muhlis, 2011, Dimensi Interaksi Aktor Dalam proses Perumusan Kebijakan Publik, Graha Ilmu, Yogyakarta.

36. Maddison Sarah, Denniss Richard, 2009, To Australian Public Policy, Theory and Practice, Cambridge University Press.

37. Mas'oed. Mohtar, 2003, Politik, Birokrasi dan Pembangunan, Pustaka Pelajar, Yogyakarta.

38. Mas'oed. Mohtar, 2003, Ekonomi-Politik, Internasional dan Pembangunan, Pustaka Pelajar, Yogyakarta.

39. Miles, Matthew B, dan Huberman, A. Michael, 2009, Analisis Data Kualitatif, Buku Sumber Tentang metode-Metode Baru, Universitas Indonesia Press, Jakarta.

40. Moleong, Lexy.J, 2004, Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif, Edisi Revisi, Remaja Rosdakarya, Bandung.

41. Moran Michael, Rein Martin, Goodin Robert.E, 2015, Handbook Kebijakan Publik, Nusa Media, Bandung

42. Muhadjir, H. Noeng, 2002, Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif, Edisi Ke IV, Rake Sarasin, Yogyakarta.

43. Muhadjir, H. Noeng, 2001, Filsafat Ilmu, Positivisme, Post Positivisme, dan Post Modernisme, Edisi II, Rake Sarasin. Yogyakarta.

44. Mulyana, Deddy, 2004, Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif, Paradigma Baru Ilmu Komunikasi dan Ilmu Sosial Lainnya, remaja Rosdakarya, Bandung.

45. Nugroho, Riant, 2012, Public Policy, Dinamika Kebijakan, Analisis Kebijakan, dan Manajemen Kebijakan, Kompas Gramedia.

46. Parsons, Wayne, 2005, Public Policy, Pengantar Teori dan Praktek Analisis

Kebijakan, Kencana Predana Media Group, Jakarta.

47. Purwanto, Erwan Agus dkk, 2015, Mengembanmgkan Profesi Analis Kebijakan, Gadjah Mada University Press, Yogyakarta.

48. Pendit, Nyoman S. (1994). Ilmu Pariwisata Sebuah Pengantar Perdana , Pradnya Pramita Jakarta :

49. Ripley, Randall.B, 1985, Policy Analysis In Political Science, Nelson-Hall Publishers, Chicago, United States of America.

50. Rudito, Bambang dan Famiola, Melia, 2002, Social Mapping, Metode Pemetaan Sosial, Teknik Memahami Suatu Masyarakat atau KOmuniti, Rekayasa Sains, Bandung.

51. Subarsono et,al, 2016, Kebijakan Publik dan Pemerintahan Kolaboratif, Isu-Isu Kontemporer, Center For Policy &Management Studies, FISIPOL UGM, Gava Media, Yogyakarta.

52. Stone, Deborah, 1997, Policy Paradox: The Art Of Political Decision Making, W.W. Norton & company, Inc., 500 Fifth Avanue, New York.

53. Spillane J.J ,1987, Pariwisata Indonesia Sejarah dan Prospeknya, Kanisius, Yogyakarta.

54. Simmons, Robert, H and Dvorin, Eugene, P, 1997, Public Administration, Value Policy, and Change, Published by Alfred Publishing Co.,Inc.

55. Shihab, Alwi, 2001, Islam Sufistik, Islam Pertama dan Pengaruhnya Hingga Kini di Indonesia.

56. Tiro, Muhammad Arif, 2011, Penelitian: Skripsi, Tesis, dan Disertasi, Andi Publisher, Makassar.

57. Tjokrowinoto, Moeljarto, 2002, State of The Art Ilmu Pemerintahan Negara, Jurnal ISIP UGM, Yogyakarta.

58. Tullock, Gordon, 2002, Government Failure,A Primer in Public Choice, Cato Institute, Washington D.C

59. Vellas, Francois & Lionel Becherel, 2008. Pemasaran Pariwisata Internasional, Yayasan Obor Indonesia, Jakarta.

60. Wahab, Salah (1976) Menejemen Kepariwisataan Terjemahan Frans Gromang ,
    a. Jakarta: PT Pradnya Paramita

61. Wahab, Solichin, Abdul, 2014, Analisis Kebijakan, dari Formulasi ke Penyusunan Model-Model Implementasi Kebijakan Publik, Bumi Aksara, Jakarta.

62. Wahab, Solichin, Abdul, 1999, Ekonomi Politik Pembangunan, Bisnis Indonesia Era Orde Baru dan di Tengah Krisis Moneter, Danar Wijaya, Brawijaya University Press, Malang.

63. Wibawa, Samodra, 2011, Politik Perumusan Kebijakan Publik, Graha Ilmu, Yogyakarta.

64. Wibawa, Samodra, 1994, Kebijakan Publik, Proses dan Analisis, Intermedia, Jakarta.

65. Wijaya, Andi Feefta& Danar, Oscar Radyan, 2014, Manajemen Publik, Teori dan Praktek, Universitas Brawijaya Press (UB Press), Malang, Indonesia.

66. Winarno, budi, 2004, Teori dan Proses Kebijakan Publik, Media Pressindo, Yogyakarta.

67. Sumber Lain:

68. Pedoman Penulisan Disertasi, 2017, Program Pasca Sarjana, Universitas Negeri Makassar, Edisi Ketujuh, Badan Penerbit UNM.

69. Pangeran, Husnullah dan Husain, Thamrin, 2015, Laporan Akhir Kegiatan "Riset Daya Saing Industri Pariwisata Kabupaten/Kota Di Provinsi Maluku Utara", kerjasama antara Badan Penelitian dan Pengembangan Daerah Provinsi Maluku Utara dengan Yayasan DIAHI Maluku Utara