

# Digitization Of Pakistan And PTI Government: An Analysis

Nusrat Bano<sup>a</sup> Dr. Muhammad Azhar<sup>b</sup> Dr. Anwar Ali<sup>c</sup> Muhammad Rizwan Haleemi<sup>d</sup>  
Shaza Khalid<sup>e</sup>

- a. *Ph.D. Scholar Department of Political Science, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan.*
- b. *Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan. (Correspondence author) [muhammad.azhar@gcuf.edu.pk](mailto:muhammad.azhar@gcuf.edu.pk)*
- c. *Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan.*
- d. *Ph.D. Scholar Department of Political Science, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan.*
- e. *Graduate student Department of Political Science, Government College University Faisalabad, Pakistan.*

## Abstract

Governance is a set of rules and regulations to run the public affairs smoothly. Good Governance is one of the pre-requisites to achieve the goal of prosperity and development and governments channelized different tools including E-Governance for better and prompt public service delivery. E-Governance is nothing but the usage of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) in governing modes and techniques. There is no good governance without accountability and transparency. Digitization of governing affairs was the central theme of Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf (PTI)'s manifesto during election 2018 which emphasized over the transparency and accountability in running day to day business of the government. The manifesto of the party has theoretical assessment to reform governance with use of advanced technology. The (PTI) government adopted the citizens-centric approach to boost up the E-Governance. The party has adopted the citizens-centric approach to boost up the E-Governance. The instant research finds whether the PTI in government succeeded to implement its vision to digitize Pakistan or not? The research also makes an attempt to frame the aims and objectives in transforming conventional to digitized administrative mechanism. Both qualitative and quantitative techniques are applied in this research.

**Key Words:** Accountability, Digitalization, Governance, Manifesto, Transparency, Technology

## Introduction

Digitalization is a subject matter of information and technological trend of the contemporary world. It is a changing oriented process from traditional methodology to more advanced technology. It is an essence of public administration and service delivery but with association of digitalization. In response, governments of the world are changing their governing modes with applied Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs). It is considered that use of information technology brings revolutionary changes under public

services. It engages governments with various actors including business and citizens under rapid and easy sources. The main purpose of E-Governance is to improve process of governance and demands of the citizens.

Historically, trendy digital governance came from sector of e-business in the early 1990s. It seems reliable to deliver better quality of services and make public administration responsible. The application of technology also open the way of democracy calling e-democracy, where citizens have better access to information and remain vigilant about to political activities of their rulers

at twenty four hours. The people of the world are considered it as source towards participatory democracy. (Lee Geiller & Lee, 2019).

The link between information and communication technology (ICT) and development have been articulated globally. The main purpose of international agencies is to counter alarming bell of corruption and other malpractices. Moreover, there is huge gap between have and have not because advanced countries were enjoying more technological development than developing due to scarcity of ICT. On that result, decisions are being taken massively to bring all glob under mainstreaming ICT. The revolution of ICT developing countries emerged in the era of 1960s. The explosive advancement of information and communication technologies is a drastic change under governance. This unprecedented development boosted up citizens for better lives. The emerging innovations make societies more competent and smart. The concept of online website is being deployed to improve efficiency and effeteness of public affairs and decision making process (Lee Geiller & Lee, 2019).

Digital governance is the heart of digital infrastructure. It is not just technology but a process to interact with government and citizens continuously. ICTs involve various actors in governing affairs including citizens, business communities and global communities with native communities. In perspective of Pakistan, electronic governance is being practiced since 2002. But, it is still under initial phase due to various reasons including techno-political, economic and social. The institution naming (Electronic Government Directorate) was established under the control of (Ministry of Science and Technology) to modernize socio-economic condition of the country and to improve Information and Communication Technology (ICT) (Shaikh & Shah, 2016).

Government of Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf, ex-ruling party, had keen interest to make Pakistan digital. The Prime Minster Imran Khan inagurated several programs to boost up E-Governance in Pakistan. He announced 'Digital Pakistan Vision' with aim to promote digitalization in Pakistan. Policy "Digital Pakistan Vision" of the Prime Minister had the ambition to improve digital Infrastructure, e-literacy and digital connectivity. The ruling party approved its first 'Digital Pakistan Policy' in 2018. The aim of premium was to establish digital 'ecosystem' through infrastructural and institutional development involving various actors. The main purpose of the Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf government was to use digital technology for effective and efficient governance in respect of socio-economic development, The Ministry of Information Technology and Telecommunications (MoITT) is the sources which would monitor, implement and regulate policies about electronic governance (Jahangir, 2020).

Besides, the 'Digital Pakistan Policy 2021' is another initiative by the government to improve socioeconomic wellbeing ensuring affordable, reliable and modern digital services. It could be the result of better social services to their citizens that enable them to get easy access toward government departments. The government strongly believes that mass adoption of emerging new trends is necessary to meet new global challenges, governance models and social interaction. But it could be possible with mass adoption of technological use (Khan, 2021).

The research will finds out the answers of the questions that what was the theoretical assessment of Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf (PTI) government to digitize Pakistan? It will analyze whether or not government of Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf remained successful to implement its digital policy?

### Aims and Objectives of Political Parties through Manifestos:

Manifestos are the form of political communication that show the policies and intentions of the political parties. It is a multidimensional matter of the concern political party. The election manifesto has ideological aims and objectives. It is a forum where voter can observe the position of the party on the basis of policies and proposed plans given by party. This course of action makes able voters to take decision according to vision and ambitions of the political parties (Laver, 2001).

Political organization is the essential component in process of political development in general and specific for democracy. It is the progressive and collaborative action of the political organization collectively. It may be considered an effective tool for socio-economic and political development. It represents collective aims and objectives to take active participation in mainstream politics. Basically, manifesto of the party is the mirror of the ideology, vision and ambition. It may be the proposed plan where voters can observe the intentions of the party. There are several types of reforms including socio-administrative and legal reforms have been introduced in the manifesto.

### Theoretical Assessment of (PTI) towards Reformation of Governance: in the Name of “The Road to Naya Pakistan”

The party realized in its vision that there are multiple issue in governance system of the country such in record keeping, inefficient data collection, intra-coordination between departments, tax evasion, black economy and bureaucratic hurdles both federal and provincial levels. Besides, party would ensure the capitalization of digital financial services to boost up digitization of documentation. The whistle-

blowers program will be established to facilitate to citizens to report suspicious behavior of the entities through community call centers. The electronic mapping of property and its linking would be completed through CNIC. Further, safe city project would also be improved under digitization of traffic violation tickets and enforcing traffic laws. The electronic paper and data archiving of the legal cases of the previous ten years would be recorded. The monitoring and evaluation indicators of socio-economic would be digitized with guarantee of performance management capability of both district and village councils (The Road to Naya Pakistan, 2018).

Accordingly, the culture of secrecy would be activated with the practice of “Right to Information” and “Right to Services”. Moreover, actions of government, records and information would be opened for the purpose of public scrutiny. The funds would be allocated and capacities of public sectors would be rejuvenated for effective implementation of Right to Information (RIT) laws. The public access would be safeguarded related to budget documentations and official data. The audit reports would be produced timely. Moreover, complains of citizens would be addressed regarding limited access to information (The Road to Naya Pakistan, 2018).

Manifesto is the systematic approach which has been discussed through various ways. Governance is the systematic study of political science and public administration. Each political entity makes an effort to encroach power of the government participating as active voter of the country. Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf was the ruling party, introduced its manifesto during campaign of election of 2018. The party tried to portray its vision whereas reformation of governance had been introduces comprehensively. The party posed that governance system would be digitize taking up revolutionary and speedy steps. The

party realized that governing system must be digitalized for the purpose of welfare and progressive state. The ruling party introduced intra-administrative and inter-administrative reforms replacing paper work to paperless work. Moreover, party has the ambition to increase capability and credibility of the public administration to achieve the objectivity of accountability and transparency.

1. (PTI) Manifesto (2018) regarding E-Governance:
  - Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf promised that the party would formulate national digital policy and deploy digital infrastructure for the purpose citizen's centric approach.
  - The party would establish digital administration to facilitate its citizens to easy and rapid services delivery and justice.
  - The party would promote the culture of secrecy and would ensure open government. The party would also promote accountability and transparency according to international obligations.

Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf government had the ambition in its manifesto to curb corruption from Pakistan. The party manifested that transparency would be ensured in public affairs through open government. Moreover, the party ensured that accountability would also be guaranteed when party came into power. The ruling party also launched its first digital policy aim to transfer Pakistan into digital community. Announcing its policy the top leadership explained that it has three main objectives including creation of more jobs, enhance export of IT products and promotion of E-Governance to control corruption. From the top leadership, Asad Umar said to Media that now 115,000 youth were working in IT industry which would be increased. For that purposes, he said IT student would be awarded by scholarships under digital policy.

Besides, he said that government data would also be opened to ensure transparency and accountability to counter corruption.

The party has also announced to make National Accountability Bureau (NAB) fully autonomous body to eliminate legal gaps such as 'voluntary return' and 'plea bargains'. The party has the vision to adoption of E-Governance at mass level to digitize legal affairs, land record and government records. This process would ensure the access of citizens towards actions of government: records, information and budget reports. The vision of Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf proposed new whistle blower initiatives for its citizens to report against malpractice of public official through online community call centers. Moreover, party has the vision to introduced women police desks centers to facilitate women. The party has the vision that institution of the police would be depoliticized. The land, water and extortion mafia would be counter and eliminated from Karachi using more sophisticated digital technology (Pakistan Tehrik-e-Insaf Manifesto for 2018 Elections, 2018).

The Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf (PTI) tried to produce new methodology regarding governing affairs to implement its manifesto smoothly. The party tried to show its interest to develop digital inclusive society. The ruling party manifested that citizen's centric approach would be adopted for the purpose of digitally inclusive society by adopting the tradition digital governance. Further, party showed its interest to deploy digital infrastructure both within intra-administrative and inter-administrative structure. Basically, provision of easy and rapid service delivery was the main motto of the top leadership of the (PTI). Besides it, structural and normative orientation is the main objective of the party to eradicate traditional behavior such as malpractices from traditional administration. The adoption of characteristics of Good Governance and new

precedents to reform public administration are also the main objectives of (PTI) through E-Governance. Due to it, core vision of the party to promote accountability, transparency and openness according to international standards. The top leadership is also wanted to meet with international obligation adopting new trends of advancement to make Pakistan more and more progressive and advanced. The party tried to realize that adoption new trends of (E-Governance) are the need of the hour.

### **Prime Minister Digital Policies**

Digitalization is considered solution of the most of the problems in Pakistan. It ensures better quality of citizens' life and economic wellbeing but with the guarantee of accessible, reliable, affordable and high quality ICT services. There are many revolutionary efforts have been made by the government to make Pakistan digital.

### **Digital Vision 2019**

The digital vision has been designed to bring both government and private sector into digitally inclusive and progressive society. The vision of electronic governance would be focused on strategic pillars including digital infrastructure, skill, literacy, entrepreneurship and innovation. Basically, the policy has the objective to establish digital ecosystem for the rapid service delivery. The access and connectivity ensures availability of internet accepting fundamental rights of the underserved communities of the country. Digital Infrastructure is the deployment of technological advancement and its uses in secure manners. E-Government policy of government will ensure digitization of intra-governments process for efficient and open environment. Digital skills and e-literacy is the main intention of digital policy of government to create more and more skilled people through implementing policies. Innovations and Entrepreneurship is also basic aim to develop and flourish more and more trend

according to needs and requirements of the contemporary world (The Digital Pakistan Policy: Vision and Execution, 2020).

### **Digital Pakistan Policy 2021**

Digital Pakistan policy 2021 would ensure fast delivery and deployment of digital technology to boost up socio-economic wellbeing of the country. The ministry of Information Technology and Telecommunication (MoITT) is the coordinating, planning and directing wing of the government. The (PTI) would also launch programs and projects for the revolutionary development. The arm wing would ensure affordable, modern reliable availability of digital technology. It strongly believes in mass participation of citizens in mainstreaming process of digitalization (Khan 2021).

Emergence of portal is considered as flagship initiatives for open government programs. The aim of creation of dataset portals is to fulfill major goals of open government: such as accountability of bureaucracy, evaluation of stated performance and transparency of public data. The main focus of the policy makers lies in E-Governance, E-Government and E-commerce development enabling it, to meet new challenges and trends. Thus, major aim of all this process is to establish E-Governance: to ensure transparency, effectiveness and accountability of affairs of government. Further, its aim is to generate opportunities for more trendy innovations.

The Holistic Digital strategy is a peace-meal approach of the Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf accepting its importance. It is considered necessary to the promotion of technological use in health, education and agriculture to bring all sectors. It also promotes E-Commerce encouraging citizens to use technology.

Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf (PTI) Objectives behind E-Governance

## To Deliver Better Public Services

Public services are essential for survival and development. It is characterized with the socio-economic prosperity of the citizens. It is considered effective tool to reduce socio-economic inequalities. The some theorists analyze that there is strong association between transparent public services delivery system and socio-economic development. While, use of computerized technology in delivering services is called e-governance. It neglects the direct control of the government and community participation could be guaranteed through E-Government. The use of Information and Telecommunication Technology (ICT) would overcome the chances of malpractices in government affairs and improve quality of decentralization (Shaikh & Shah, 2016).

The main objective of Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf Government is to improve its service delivery methodology through E-Governance. The Government of (PTI) established E-Khidmat Markaz a Facilitation centers. It called "One Window" facilitation center providing government services, information and easy and quick access toward government services. Accordingly, citizens avail opportunities without visiting different departments. The e-Khidmat Markaz was established to fulfill requirements from demand and supply side. It has multifaceted dimensions and services under one roof providing more than 80 services. Due to that E-Governance has been considered effective and efficient solution to delivery better services and faculties. So, incorporating of both E-Governance and existing system should be focused with greater consideration addressing problematic areas with deeper understanding (Ashraf, 2019).

Moreover, government of (PTI) also launched Pakistan Citizens' Portal (PCP) mobile applications. It provides access of citizens towards 70,000 government departments with

single click of the citizens. It has been appreciated as second best ones in Global Summit that was held in Dubai 2019. There are 1,173 million people including local and overseas have been registered and complains were addresses from all areas of Pakistan. It is estimated with ratio of 92% from all provinces in including Islamabad and Azad Kashmiri. The app facilitates citizens to loge their reservations and immediate resolution (Dahri, Massan, & Maitlo, 2020).

## 6.2 To Ensure Open Government

Open government ensure direct participation of citizens in public affairs. It can be studied both from perspectives of government and citizens. It is associated with openness guaranteeing concept of accountability and answerability. It is considered an effective pillar towards socio-political rights of the citizens. Open government has been identifies with various activities such as law making, policy making, budgeting and services delivery. It aware the citizens that when, where and how government make policy and its implementation ensuring participation. With changing trends, E-Government portals and website are considered effective tools of communication between citizens and government.

The information Quality (IQ) of the online websites is the essential component to ensure credibility of the government departments regularly. It is a vital functional entity towards Good Governance, democracy and service deliver methodology at local and national levels. The trend of e-government is the most recent phenomenon for the developing countries. Pakistan has been possessed in the middle tier according to E-Government Development Index (United Nation, 2018). Historically, country introduced its first step regarding e-government since 2002. Further, country introduced e-government services to developed information society. Now, these E-Services mechanism is the

vital sources of the people to get easy access towards information. The main objective of the government through E-Government is to increase efficiency, effectiveness, accountability and to enhance quality of services. Pakistan positioned 158<sup>th</sup> out of 193 countries with 0.2580 according to survey of UN e-government. It cannot be denied that Pakistan has been faced many challenges such as absence of culture monitoring, regulatory and implementation (Rasool, Warraich, & Rorissa, 2019).

The development of infrastructure of information and communication technologies (ICTs) remained limited priority and limited fund was allocated. Punjab was categorized second stage of development inspiring people to E-Services in Pakistan. Thus, Pakistan survives with lack of research in the field of E-Government general and information quality (IQ) particular. The result is that, nothing development could be done without adequate policy making and research. The government must be responsible for that purposes. The surveys should be done to explore the value of E-Government websites in term of local interests. The main purposes of the researcher should be to find a valuable result which could be beneficial for policy makers. More, research should be focused to find out dimensions of online websites and portals of government through community perspectives (Rasool, Warraich, & Rorissa, 2019).

Open government is one of the priorities which have been found by the (PTI) government. The government initiated culture of open government through E-Government in Pakistan adopting (ICT). The party came into power with the aim of "Naya Pakistan" having vision to empower its citizens and make Pakistan free from corruption. The party has the vision of welfare state implementing health, education emergency in Pakistan. It also promised to boost up jobs and employment opportunities deploying digital infrastructure. The party promised to digitize all

departments and new federal information commissioner should be allocated to regulate transparency. Moreover, multilateral, coordinated efforts have been done by the party towards more responsive and accountable government (Serfraz, 2020).

### **To Ensure Public Accountability**

The term public accountability is refers to make public agents answerable and responsible about their actions. It involves public officials to provide information, justification about their actions. Public accountability has been used a tool to control bureaucracy, corruption and misuse of power. There is no concept of efficiency, transparency and openness without efficient practices of public accountability. It guarantees to better services, state responsiveness, and utilities (Gaventa & McGee, 2013).

Accountability has been identifies under the obligation of public administration. It is a unique combination of voter and their representative where citizens are expected to account their representatives. Historically, emergence of web portals changed the way of study from traditional to more modern interaction. Owing to it, accountability with the combination of transparency is the subject matter of the study. The online portal or dataset has gained central attraction of the whole digital system due to availability of huge number of material. So, it is defined as centralized functional entity to access public data. But, the questions have been raised that the whether portals are organized and disclosed to find required data properly and to answer the concerned questions or not? So, without proper management appropriation dataset could not fulfill its objectives (Lourenço, 2015).

Public accountability has been recognized as an essential instrument for good governance. It is

considered as a primary source of monitoring public stakeholders. It is a driving force which pressurizes public administration to oblige their promises under the expectations of their citizens. Both developed and developing countries has adopted the agenda to enhancing accountability through several initiatives such as E-Government or E-government. It is considered as an effective instrument to enhance public accountability. The United Nation Organization (UNO) is also promotes value of E-Government to monitor public administration. Robert stated that easy and rapid access towards government information could become possible through E-Government. On that result, public administration remains more responsible and accountable in front of people (Al-Shbail & Aman, 2018).

The Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf claimed in its manifesto that when party came into power, it would enhance the capability and capacity of institution of the accountability. The party would counter all scandals of corruption regardless of political affiliation with iron hands. Accountability is the most prominent slogan of the party during campaign of election of 2018. The party chairman Imran Khan announced its eleven points promising administrative, judicial and electoral reforms to control abuse of power and promotion of culture of accountability (Warraich, 2021).

### **To Ensure Transparency:**

Transparency is the essential condition for the promotion of public values. It usually is defined as a check on the internal working of an organization by external stakeholders. It is considered a turning point to ensure due process and prevent corruption. Moreover, it could also be seen as source to participating actively both public organization and their agents. So, it could build public trust and involve all agents in the mainstreaming public development process (Douglas & Meijer, 2016).

### **Right of Information and its Nexus with Transparency:**

The right of information confirms the infiltration of participatory democracy. Its detail may be subject matter of good governance and accountability. It is a vital instrument for instilling trust and confidence between citizens and government. Besides, the right of information makes public officials more valuable and proficient to deliver better services. This notion is guaranteed under Article 19 A of the constitution of Pakistan. It is the well-established notion against nepotism, arbitrary decisions and corruption.

According to Article 19 A, every citizen could access to information in all important subjects without any restrictions for the purpose of implementation of right of information. The constitution of Pakistan ensures following guarantees through:

- Right of Access to Information Act, 2017,
- Punjab Transparency and Right to Information Act 2013,
- KPK Right to Information Act, 2013,
- Sindh Transparency and Right to Information Act, 2016
- Balochistan Freedom of Information Act, 2005

The Right of Access to Information Act 2017 has been studied in broad perspectives of legislative, executive and other departments that responsible to public functions. The main objective of this act is to anticipate right to information regarding policy making, execution and decision making. It has been acknowledged as universal phenomenon to measure the credibility of governance and rule of law to gain the vision of true spirit of transparency and accountability in government affairs. The respective objectives are only possible through free access to records of public



institutions which affect the daily life of the citizens. Basically, it has become accepted a journey towards socio-economic development and supremacy of law that could be possible with implementation of pure form of checks of the government activities. In contemporary world, it has become an indispensable tool of the citizens towards their legal authorities to check and monitor its actions as well as performance. Now, it has become a parameter of openness and accountability which ensure government towards public services (Qaiser & Qaiser, 2020).

It is the easier source toward information. Now, public transparency usage with digitization is called E-Governance. It is the new trend of the contemporary world to rapid due process and control malpractices. Right to Information Act authorized citizens to access public information. Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf commitment was done through its manifesto to implement rights to information act since party remained came into power. The government of (PTI) incorporated right to information act 2013 in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The party embraced the act to meet the requirements of good governance and international standard (Azam, 2020).

### **To Promote Decentralization**

Decentralization is refers to transfer of power or responsibility from entire government to units of the state. Moreover, decentralization can be defined as redistribution of responsibility to public to private authorities and other subordinate departments. It is associated to all functions including managing, financing and planning (Ozmen, 2014).

There is the core relationship between decentralization and local governance. In the tech-driven century, local governance is run under E-Services which make local government more efficient and responsible. The districts governments of the Punjab under the shadow of

Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf tried to establish e-Local society under the Punjab Local government Act (PLGA) 2019. According to, Secretary of Local Government and Community Development Department; this move would allow citizens to actively participate both in planning and managing in the governance affairs. The new system would empower citizens of the province to participate in the affairs of the governance (Rasheed, 2018).

Baldia Online system has been designed to achieve the stated objectives of the Punjab government including Punjab local Government Act (PLGA) 2019. This project ensures the accountability and answerability within the provincial and federal laws. The (PLGA) was established to specify the needs and requirements of the mega cities and largely urban districts of the respective province. It also introduced online IT based projects with the aim of transformation from manual to e-governance. This has the purposes of better decision making, Though, Punjab information Technology Board (PITB) and Punjab Municipal Development Fund Company (PMDFC) all the computerized departmental data has been operated (Punjab Cities Programme, 2019).

The Punjab government developed more sophisticated modern techniques to counter corruption in administrative affairs of the government through (PITB). Moreover, the government has the objective to improve service delivery through modern technology. The (PITB) also introduces E-Pay, Police Khidmat Markaz, E-Khidmat Centre, Citizen Feedback Monitoring Programs, Baldia Online, Qeemat Punjab and E-Libraries. The institution (PITB) said that cyber security and E-Commerce are also being linked with federal government to counter malpractice and irregularities. The services of the (PITB) have been expanded under various franchise moods. (Digital policy to transform governance in Punjab, 2020).

## Conclusion:

It is concluded that Pakistan Tahreek-e-Insaf (PTI) has adopted several policies to digitize public administration in its hometown. The Government of (PTI) tried to implement its ambitious manifesto regarding tech-inclusive society. Moreover, both intra and inter-administrative structural reformation have been adopted through online websites and citizens portals. Likewise, in Punjab; several local departments have been digitized to facilitate citizens and to ensure transparency of local affairs. The government of Punjab under the shadow of (PTI) government has established “E-Khidmat Markaz” in different municipalities of the province for quick and easy access for the citizens. The provincial government has established “Baldia Online” in urban cities to transfer of manual activates of E-Governance. The government tried to build tech inclusive society involving both government and citizens to ensure accountability and transparency. But, modern tech-inclusive society and E-Governance could not be established in its active and true sense. The installment of pure digitization is still a dream in Pakistan. Pakistan is still has been run with traditional methodology under paper work. Without it, the government of (PTI) has full-fledged ambition to boost up E-Governance in Pakistan.

## References

1. Digital policy to transform governance in Punjab. (2020, December 22). *tribune* <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2276263/digital-policy-to-transform-governance-in-punjab>
2. Al-Shbail, T., & Aman, A. (2018). E-government and accountability How to mitigate the disorders and dysfunctions of accountability relationships. *Transforming Government: People, Process and Policy*, 12(2), 155-165.
3. Ashraf, D. A. (2019). *Situational Analysis of Self-Sustainability of Lahore: Punjab Economic Research Institute*.
4. Azam, M. (2020). *Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf, (PTI) made a specific commitment through its manifesto that it*. Islamabad: Pakistan information Commission.
5. Dahri, A. S., Massan, S.R., & Maitlo, A. A. (2020). Usability of Egovernance Application for Citizens of Pakistan. *Glosas de innovación aplicadas a la pyme*, 265-276.
6. Punjab Cities Programme. (2019, March 25). Retrieved September 6, 2022, from <https://lgcd.punjab.gov.pk/>: <https://lgcd.punjab.gov.pk/punjab-cities-programme>
7. Douglas, S., & Meijer, A. (2016). Transparency and public value; Analyzing the transparence practices and value creation of public utilities. *International Journal of Public Administration*, 39(12), 1-26.
8. Gaventa, J., & McGee, R. (2013). The Impact of Transparency and Accountability Initiatives. *Development Policy Review*, 1-37.
9. Jahangir, a. (2020, January 3). Situationer: The ‘Digital Pakistan’ challenge. *dawn* [www.dawn.com/news/1525977/situationer-the-digital-pakistan-challenge](http://www.dawn.com/news/1525977/situationer-the-digital-pakistan-challenge)
10. Khan, K. Z. (2021, July 25). Can ‘Digital Pakistan’ become a reality? *dawn* <https://www.dawn.com/news/1636817>

11. Laver, M. (2001). *Estimating the Policy Position of Political Actors*. London: Routledge.
12. Lee-Geiller, S., & Lee, T. (. (2019). Using government websites to enhance democratic E-governance: A conceptual model for evaluation. *Government Information Quarterly*, 36(2), 1-19.
13. Lourenço, R. P. (2015). An analysis of open government portals: A perspective of transparency. *Government Information Quarterly*, 322-323.
14. Office, P. M. (2018, July 9). *The Road to Naya Pakistan*. pmo <https://pmo.gov.pk/documents/manifesto-pti.pdf>
15. Ozmen, A. (2014). Notes to The Concept of Decentralization. *European Scientific Journal*, 10 (10), 415-4123.
16. Qaiser, K., & Qaiser, Z. (2020). Incontrovertible Nexus between Transparency and Right of Information in Pakistan's Perspective. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 4(6), 292.300.
17. Rasheed, K. (2018, May 15). District administration set to make digital transition. *tribune* <https://tribune.com.pk/story/2221670/district-administration-set-make-digital-transition>
18. Rasool, T., Warraich, N. F., & Rorissa, A. (2019). Citizens' assessment of the information quality of e-government websites. *Global Knowledge Memory and Communication* , 1-18.
19. Serfraz, A. (2020). Transforming The Education System and Socialsafety Nets:A Theoretical Discussion in the light of Naya (New) Pakistan Manifesto for Change and Road to Prosperity. *Pakistan Journal of Applied Economics*, 30(2),300-317.
20. Shaikh, A. Z., & Shah, U. L. (2016). Public Service Delivery and e-Governance: The Case of Pakistan. *International Journal for Infonomics*, 9(2),1161-1189.
21. Team, d. P. (2020, April 23 ). *The Digital Pakistan Policy: Vision and Execution*. digitalpakistan. <https://digitalpakistan.pk/blog/the-digital-pakistan-policy-vision-and-execution/>
22. The Centre for Peace, S. a. (2018). *Pakistan Tehrik-e-Insaf Manifesto for 2018 Elections*. Islamabad: The Centre for Peace, Security and Developmental Studies.
23. Warraich, S. (2021, August 30). *Accountability examined*. *thenews* <https://www.thenews.com.pk/tns/detail/707062-accountability-examined>